

Minutes of the CIPC meeting held on 9/16/2009, Flynn building

Present:

Pascal Cleve,
Ted Fedynyshyn,
Jose Garcia-Meitin,
Dan Messina,
Larry Rowe,
Andrea Terkelson

- 1) Approved minutes of the 9/9/2009 meeting.
- 2) Discussion of unspent capital monies:
 1. Investigated ways to carry over unspent capital money to the following years, possibly through town meeting articles or by establishing a special fund.
 2. Investigated ways to cancel or rescind a project if it is no longer relevant.
- 3) Approved the project completion form (see attachement)
 1. This form will be sent shortly to all department heads
- 4) Reviewed the Police Vehicle Analysis (see attachment)
 1. Police vehicles other than cruisers are clearly Capital Items and should be tracked as such.
 2. The majority of the neighbouring towns track cruisers in their Capital budget.
 3. Will work with the Chief of Police to get more data on cruisers, such as number of cruisers, replacement schedule, annual mileage, number of hours of operation (Hobbs reading if so equipped).
- 5) This committee will investigate how neighbouring towns manage school capital items.
- 6) Larry Rowe will be the school liaison.
- 7) Deadline to ammend the bylaw, if needed, is the end of December.
- 8) Meeting adjourned at 9:00PM

Sudbury CIPC Project Completion Report

Project Name:

Fiscal year:

Department:

Report Author:

Capital Budget Approved (\$):

Final Project Cost (\$):

Budget Variance (\pm \$):

Project Completion: Was project complete in expected fiscal year (y/n):

Describe reason for lack of completion and estimate expected completion date.

Project Scope: Was project implemented as outline in funding proposal (y/n):

Describe any substantial changes in project scope, why changes occurred, and effects on project.

Project Budget: Provide explanation for budget variance greater than $\pm 10\%$ of budget and source of any additional funding.

Recommendations/advice for similar future projects (optional).

Police Vehicle Analysis

Aggregated Data:

Municipality	Pop.	Road Miles	Replacement Cycle (marked)	New/Used	Budget	Notes
Ashland	14,674	78.81	100K miles	New	Capital	Unmarked cars purchased used at auction
Bedford	12,595	80.37	3 years/75K miles	New	Capital	Unmarked cars replaced every 5 years
Berlin	2,380	44.39	1 new car per year	New	Capital	Replace worst vehicle in fleet
Boxborough	4,868	38.07	4 years	New	Operating	Replace worst vehicle in fleet (~100K+ miles)
Concord	16,993	126.3	1.5-2 years	New	Capital	3 new cars one year, 4 new cars the next year
Dover	5,558	61.35	1.5 years/80K-100K miles	New	Capital	4.5 officers to staff one car
Harvard	5,981	77.35	4 years/90K miles	New	Capital	Each car shared by 2 officers
Hudson	18,113	91.19	2.5 years/100K miles	New	Capital	
Lexington	30,355	154.02	55-60K miles	New	Operating	After 1 year/30K, move new cars to non-marked
Marlborough	36,255	165.23	3 years/90-100K miles	New	Capital Outlay	Unmarked cars replaced every 5-8 years
Stow	5,902	36.23	4-5 years	New	Capital	Replace worst vehicle in fleet
Wellesley	26,613	130.32	2 years	New	Operating	Replace half of fleet every year
Westborough	17,997	110.7	3 years/100K miles	New	Capital	4-6 years from unmarked cars
Weston	11,469	113.11	1 year	New	Revolving Vehicle	4-5 years for unmarked cars

Ashland, MA,
Pop: 14,674, Road Miles: 78.81
Respondent: Lieutenant Richard Briggs

1) After how long is a newly purchased police cruiser replaced?

The Town of Ashland has recently required the police department to run line cars (marked police vehicles) until they hit 100k miles. This practice is less than ideal, and not fiscally responsible. At 100k miles, the cars are literally run into the ground at that point. It poses a major safety concern for officers who are operating the cars and depending on them to respond to emergencies. What you must understand is that these cars are not driven easy. In fact, it is quite the opposite. They are driven very hard at times responding to emergencies, in pursuits, inclement weather, off road when necessary, and most are involved in several accidents before their life expectancy is up. One other key factor to note is that police cruisers are required to idle alot, sometimes for three entire shifts (especially in the winter months). This certainly adds alot of wear and tear onto an engine. A cruiser with 100k miles, probably has the wear and tear of a car with 300k miles on it after you factor in the idling time. Finally, safety is a major factor in police cruiser replacement. Safety of the officers operating them and the citizens depending on them to get the officers to emergencies. At approximately 60k to 70k miles, we start seeing a significant increase in costly mechanical repairs and failure of major components. This is the ideal time to trade a police cruiser. The savings seen by not replacing the car, is ultimately spent in the repairs costs .

2) Are cruisers replaced with new or used cars?

Marked police vehicles are always replaced with new cars. Recently, we have begun purchasing our unmarked police vehicles (administrative vehicles) used by detectives, Lieutenants, court officer at the car auction at Adesa in Framingham. Our recent purchases have been late model Ford Taurus, Ford 500 and an Explorer. We have seen considerable savings in doing this and the cars are former program cars with very low miles. Something to keep in mind is that these vehicles still need to be equipped with emergency equipment (lights, sirens, radios, etc) which can increase the cost.

3) Are cruisers purchased from funds within the police department's operating budget or the town's capital budget?

All department vehicles are purchased out of the town's capital budget.

Bedford, MA
Pop: 12,595, Road Miles: 80.37
Respondent: Chief James Hicks

1) After how long is a newly purchased police cruiser replaced?

Marked Police cruisers are evaluated after 3 years using 75k as the mileage criteria as well a running hours (usually 3,500 hrs using installed meters). Unmarked cruisers are every 5years

2) Are cruisers replaced with new or used cars?

New

3) Are cruisers purchased from funds within the police department's operating budget or the town's capital budget?

All vehicle replacements for the town are purchased through capital budget under the direction of the DPW.

Berlin, MA
Pop: 2,380, Road Miles: 44.39
Respondent: Chief Otto Rhode

The Town of Berlin purchases one police vehicle each year. The worst vehicle in the fleet is the vehicle replaced. We only purchase new vehicles.

The vehicles funding is not from the Police operating budget, but from the Town's capital funding. The vehicle is a separate article at town meeting and is voted on the floor.

We have looked into other vehicle options..ie. lease to purchase. If you contact MHQ they can provide this information.

I would not recommend the purchase of used vehicles because of the maintenance costs.

Boxborough, MA
Pop: 4,868, Road Miles: 38.07
Respondent: Chief Richard G. Vance Jr.

#1. After how long is a newly purchased police cruiser replaced?

Answer: Firstly, we have four (4) front line, marked police cruisers.
Additionally, we have two (2) Sergeant/Supervisor "unmarked" cars
We have two (2) Unmarked department Vehicles
We have one(1) Administrative "Chiefs" vehicle.

A new police cruiser (intended to replace a marked vehicle) is included within the annual police department budget. Each year this new vehicle replaces the oldest marked unit in the fleet (this old unit is usually retained and used to replace a sergeant's vehicle or an unmarked unit). The oldest marked unit that is being replaced usually has over 100,000 miles on it.

So, the answer is that a new purchased police vehicle is replaced approximately every four (4) years. (we have had years - last year FY10 - that a cruiser was not replaced because of budgetary constraints)

#2. Are Cruisers replaced with new or used cars?

Answer: Cruisers have always been replaced with new cars.

#3. Are cruisers purchased from funds within the police department's operating budget or the town's operating budget?

Answer: For many years now, a new police cruiser has been purchased from within the line item budget for the police department. The money is allocated each year in the operating budget.

As stated, we did not purchase a cruiser in last years budget for budgetary reasons (the line item was cut from the FY10 budget)

However this line item has been fully funded in the past five (5) budget cycles or so.

Concord, MA
Pop: 16,993, Road Miles: 126.3

Respondent: Deputy Chief Paul Macone

The cruisers are purchased from funds in the town's capital budget. We have refined the "normal" needed turnover of cruisers from experience and it generally always works out to having funds available for 3 new cars one year, and then 4 cars the next, and repeat this cycle. Depending on how much a particular cruiser gets used (mileage) dictates the replacement. I would guesstimate an average marked cruiser is run around 18 months to 2 years. We stagger the replacements over the fiscal year rather than replace several at a time. This stretches the length of service out some. The departments unmarked cruisers are staggered into this same number of cars cycle as well. Obviously they don't need to be replaced anywhere near as often. We purchase new cars only.

Dover, MA

Pop: 5,558, Road Miles: 61.35

Respondent: Chief Joe Griffin

Thank you for your inquiry, let me try to answer your query but as briefly as I can. Let me frame this response by first stating most departments seem to do what works best for them. I know of one department from some years ago, I believe it was Arlington, who used to purchase one or two unmarked cars per year for the Police Chief. At the end of the year they were transferred from the Police to other departments such as Board of Health, Building Department etc. to be used by those employees. Although not many communities engaged in this practice it seemed to work for this town. As to your questions;

1. Marked patrol vehicles are generally replaced somewhere around 18 months with an odometer reading of 80,000 to 100,000 miles. I stress marked vehicles as they must be the most road worthy as a department really cannot take the change of a front line vehicle breaking down while responding to a call for service.

2. Marked cruisers should always be replaced by new cars. In fact all cars are replaced with new vehicles but in some instances the use of one car is transferred to another car. To cite an example I am replacing my car this month with a new vehicle. I will transfer my current vehicle to one of the detectives and trade in their car that is now five years old. The reason I will take the new car is that I do far more driving then the detectives and much of my driving is highway so although my vehicle has 60,000 on the odometer it is in A-1 shape and transfer to the detectives will ensure two more years of cost efficient use.

3. In Dover Cruisers are capital, they should however, in my opinion, be part of the operating budget as they really don't meet the definition of a capital item. Unlike a Fire Truck or Street Sweeper that may last twenty or more years, a police cruiser (marked on the line) generally has a life of only two years. It is really not a capital item.

Lastly, let me just comment on the way that we (capital, finance, warrant committees etc.) look at vehicle purchase. We tend to look at the cruiser because it is easily identified and very visible as well as being (in some person's opinion) very expensive. We think if we forgo the purchase of just one vehicle we are really saving some money. This is not the case as we fail to look at the vehicle in terms of the officer as being an essential tool of the officer as well as his/her office. The officer is only as good as the tools we give him/her. Secondly we look at the cost of the vehicle (\$25,000 to \$30,000) as the great expense and we don't consider to cost to staff that piece of equipment. In Dover a the cost of an officer w/benefits is somewhere around \$87,500.00. It takes 4.5 officers to staff a vehicle around

the clock making the annual cost to staff the vehicle somewhere around \$390,000.00. If I do not equipment (cars) for the officers to use, I waste a very expensive commodity and cause a lapse in the service I am sworn to protect.

Harvard, MA

Pop: 5,981, Road Miles: 77.35

Respondent: Chief Edward D. Denmark

I have worked out a cruiser purchase schedule that calls for replacing cars every four years. Each of our cars is shared by two officers (working different shifts), this puts approximately 22,000 miles on each car per year. After four years, the car is replaced. In short, a pair of officers drives the same car for four years, then they are given a new one. I have found that because two officers "own" the vehicle, so to speak, maintenance and upkeep has improved tremendously.

Our cars are purchased from a recurring capital fund. There is a new car figured in to that line item every year.

Hudson, MA

Pop: 18,113, Road Miles: 91.19

Respondent: Chief Richard A. Braga Jr.

1. On average, cruisers spend about 2 ½ years on line but their replacement is dictated by the amount of miles (and condition) rather than age. We typically replace line cars when they hit 100,000 miles.
 2. Cruisers are replaced with new cars.
 3. Cruisers are purchased through the town's capital budget.
-

Lexington, MA

Pop: 30,355, Road Miles: 154.02

Respondent: Chief Mark J. Corr

Lexington purchases new cruisers each year from our operating budget. In my opinion, police cruisers that log 30,000 or more miles in one calendar year present significant difficulties in year two. The odometer is a fraction of the actual mileage put on the engine, since cruisers idle by necessity for many long hours. We purchase four new cruisers each year. The second year vehicles are then put into less demanding roles such as a patrol supervisor vehicle, back-up marked vehicle, or (when striped or marked) used by detectives. We try very hard to trade vehicles on or before the 55,000 – 60,000 odometer reading. We get significantly more trade-in value for a vehicle with this mileage. If you hold onto the vehicle too long, the repairs, the down time for malfunctions, and the general handling (safety) of the vehicle begins to be seriously compromised.

From time to time, we are able to squirrel away extra money, and with a little bit of horse trading skill, we trade older vehicles for other used vehicles. We try to buy one or two used vehicles that do not look like "police" cars for detectives and the undercover drug detective.

I have been here 26–years and my Dad was Chief from '65-'82. This discussion is very common in many communities. No matter how many times we have considered or

implemented changes, we have always come back to the above formula. It works. Unfortunately, many residents who are active in Committees and/or Town Meeting do not realize that police vehicles are not like the car in your driveway. They have heavy duty suspension, batteries, electrical systems, and more. They operate 24-7 with many different drivers. They are mobile offices. The defects and inconveniences that many residents might put up with in a family car create very difficult working environment for an officer.

This expense is a critical public safety expense. Unwise cuts or shortcuts in this area will risk the lives of officers and, at a minimum, send an unfortunate message to officers about how the community values them.

Marlborough, MA

Pop: 36,255, Road Miles: 165.23

Respondent: Chief Mark F. Leonard

We try to replace our marked cruisers every 3 years, and our unmarked cruisers every 5 to 8 years. I typically request funding for 3 or 4 marked cruisers every year, and 1 or 2 unmarked cruisers. On average, I usually end up with funding for 3 or 4 cruisers total (marked and unmarked), so we do the best we can with replacing them in a timely manner. Most of our marked units have around 90,000 to sometimes over 100,000 miles when traded in. We replace them with new cruisers.

Our police cruisers are paid for out of a capital outlay account, not our operating budget. The capital outlay accounts are somewhat different from strict capital accounts, which is used for large purchases with longer life spans. Because of the short life span of a cruiser, the city does not include them in the longer-term bonded capital items because the city would still be paying for them long after they were no longer in service. So, they are separate from our operating budget, but are not part of our long-term capital budget. If you need further explanation about how/why they are funded through a capital outlay account, I'd suggest speaking with the city's comptroller, Tom Abel.

Stow, MA

Pop: 5,902, Road Miles: 36.23

Respondent: Chief Mark Trefry

Police cruisers are a capital item here in Stow. Each year I meet with Capital Planning and explain why I need to buy a police cruiser, then it goes before town meeting for approval. Years ago, it was discussed that we incorporate the purchase of one police cruiser each year into the operating budget, but that never happened.

I would say the average cruiser is replaced every 4 or 5 years. We do not replace a vehicle simply because it reaches a specific age or mileage. We get rid of the car that gives us the most aggravation, with mechanical issues or becomes unsafe for patrol use or simply goes off warranty and costs a fortune to maintain. We always buy new patrol cars.

Wellesley, MA

Pop: 26,613, Road Miles: 130.32

Respondent: Deputy Chief William G. Brooks III

- 1) We replace half our fleet every year, so our cars last just two years. We have enough cruisers so that they are not all used every shift. If we had fewer cars, we might have to replace them more frequently.
- 2) All the vehicles we buy are new.
- 3) Since the replacement of police cruisers is a predictable and reoccurring expense, and because we usually replace the same number of cars each year, the cruisers are in our operating budget. They used to be in capital, but the town thought it made much more sense to move them into the operating budget. They've been there for years.

Westborough, MA

Pop: 17,997, Road Miles: 110.7

Respondent: Chief Alan Gordon

Our cruisers are purchased through an appropriation at the annual town meeting. The funds are not part of my budget. We usually purchase 2 cruisers each year and then every three years we purchase 3. This allows us to replace one of the administrators vehicles. We always purchase new vehicles from MHQ. Our cruisers normally have over 100,000 miles before we trade them in. We normally get three years from a front line vehicle and 4-6 years for detective or administrative staff vehicles

Weston, MA

Pop: 11,469, Road Miles: 110.7

Respondent: Chief Steven F. Shaw

We replace our patrol cars every year. We had always gotten 3 cars, for the 3 patrol sectors we have in town, but a few years ago we tried cutting back to 2 cars a year for fiscal reasons. Last year and this year we are going back to 3 cars because of the need to replace other cars in the fleet. After one year we take a sector car and either paint it and make it an unmarked car, turn it into a spare (backup) marked car or make it a supervisor's car. We have ten cars other than the sector cars so it may take 4 or 5 years to replace an unmarked or spare cruiser with a one year old patrol car. With only 2 cars a year we had some vehicles that were six years old with well over 100,000 miles on them and that first year on patrol takes a great toll on the car, shortening its life span greatly and increasing maintenance costs.

We always replace with new cars. We use money from a revolving vehicle account that is voted on at town meeting each year.