

Melone RFP Response Rankings

Updated 9/11/2018

	P Brown	L Simon	J Dretler	D Carty	B Haarde	
Cavicchio						
Criteria 1	15	5	5	10	5	
Criteria 2	7	1	4	10	4	
Criteria 3	10	5	5	15	5	
Criteria 4	5	0	0	5	5	
Criteria 5	10	1	4	10	4	
Price Proposal	10	1	1	10	1	
	<u>57</u>	<u>13</u>	<u>19</u>	<u>60</u>	<u>24</u>	34.6 Avg

	P Brown	L Simon	J Dretler	D Carty	B Haarde	
Quarry North						
Criteria 1	15	20	10	5	20	
Criteria 2	4	7	4	1	10	
Criteria 3	20	15	15	20	20	
Criteria 4	10	10	15	0	15	
Criteria 5	10	7	7	10	10	
Price Proposal	25	25	25	25	25	
	<u>84</u>	<u>84</u>	<u>76</u>	<u>61</u>	<u>100</u>	81 Avg

	P Brown	L Simon	J Dretler	D Carty	B Haarde	
EDF Renewables						
Criteria 1	20	10	15	20	10	
Criteria 2	1	4	4	0	1	
Criteria 3	15	10	10	10	10	
Criteria 4	10	5	10	5	5	
Criteria 5	10	4	4	10	7	
Price Proposal	15	10	15	15	10	
	<u>71</u>	<u>43</u>	<u>58</u>	<u>60</u>	<u>43</u>	55 Avg

Point Scale
Criteria 1 (20 max)
Criteria 2 (10 max)
Criteria 3 (20 max)
Criteria 4 (15 max)
Criteria 5 (10 max)
Price Proposal (25 max)

Melone RFP Response Ranking Comments

Updated 9/11/2018

Cavicchio Comments

J Dretler: This proposal will bring an immediate infusion of cash from the disposition of the land but will bring in minimal property tax revenue overall. There will also be additional tractor trailer traffic to Concord Rd. Concord Rd is heavily used by our students and school buses. Also, there are existing town reports that state the egress at Melone has line of sight issues which suggests safety issues. The proponent has stated that they feel the existing egress (entrance) is fine as is.

D Carty: It is not often that someone wants to do more farming in Sudbury. We should look for other areas for this business expansion within our community or risk losing them altogether.

Quarry North Comments

L Simon: Among the 3 proposals, the Quarry North proposal is the most attractive and beneficial to the town. It meets the goals of preservation of the town center land, preservation of a site of historical significance, affordable housing for at least 12 years, and avoids further congestions in town center and would bring existing litigation to a close. This proposal has the support of most town boards, committees, and commissions. It also has widespread resident support.

J Dretler: This proposal has significant contingencies. The fiscal impact is difficult to ascertain but based on the Town Manager and Finance Director's recent analysis and our experience with Avalon/Meadow Walk/National Development, we now have information that will help guide us to a development agreement that is favorable for Sudbury. There is significant support for this proposal from numerous Town Boards and Committees. There is a very complicated proposal that will require much expertise – specifically legal review. While highly dense, this proposal is in line with previously identified uses for the Melone property.

D Carty: Value and quality of life not related to the building of this project on the Melone property whatsoever, rather it is solely in *not* building it in the center of Sudbury.

EDF Renewables Comments

L Simon: This is a good proposal, but does not significantly address many of the goals identified by town boards, committees and commissions. In the abstract it is attractive, but many other practical considerations favor Quarry North.

J Dretler: I'm concerned about the length of the proposed lease term (25 years). I don't feel that it is in Sudbury's best interest to use significant developable land for solar. There may be other location in town that are better suited for solar.

D Carty: Very intriguing project; would truly make Sudbury a more "green" community. Financials look very appealing, as does the retention of ownership of the property.