



All the Fish in the Sea: Maximum Sustainable Yield and the Failure of Fisheries Management by Carmel Finley

All the Fish in the Sea: Maximum Sustainable Yield and the Failure of Fisheries Management by Carmel Finley

Review by: Daniel Pauly

The Quarterly Review of Biology, Vol. 87, No. 2 (June 2012), p. 168

Published by: [The University of Chicago Press](http://www.uchicago.edu)

Stable URL: <http://www.jstor.org/stable/10.1086/665431>

Accessed: 25/11/2015 19:02

Your use of the JSTOR archive indicates your acceptance of the Terms & Conditions of Use, available at <http://www.jstor.org/page/info/about/policies/terms.jsp>

JSTOR is a not-for-profit service that helps scholars, researchers, and students discover, use, and build upon a wide range of content in a trusted digital archive. We use information technology and tools to increase productivity and facilitate new forms of scholarship. For more information about JSTOR, please contact support@jstor.org.



The University of Chicago Press is collaborating with JSTOR to digitize, preserve and extend access to *The Quarterly Review of Biology*.

<http://www.jstor.org>

INVERTEBRATE MEDICINE. *Second Edition.*

By Gregory A. Leubart. Hoboken (New Jersey): Wiley-Blackwell. \$164.99. xv + 488 p. + 20 pl.; ill.; index. ISBN: 978-0-8138-1758-3. 2012.

ALL THE FISH IN THE SEA: MAXIMUM SUSTAINABLE YIELD AND THE FAILURE OF FISHERIES MANAGEMENT.

By Carmel Finley. Chicago (Illinois): University of Chicago Press. \$35.00. xii + 210 p.; ill.; index. ISBN: 978-0-226-24966-7. 2011.

This smart little book has all the trappings of a historical account, with endnotes, an extensive bibliography, and a comprehensive index, but it can also be read as a whodunit. The crime scene is the Pacific Ocean, and the motive was access to the fish resources that both Japan and the U.S. were exploiting and/or eyeing, especially salmon in Alaska and tuna in the Pacific, the latter also requiring small bait fishes from coastal waters in Central America.

The victim was good faith—the use of argument based on scientific evidence to articulate legitimate positions. The villain is U.S. foreign policy, specifically its fisheries branch, as personified by an ichthyologist-turned-lobbyist, Wilbert Chapman of the University of Washington. The weapon used for the deed, and the main theme of this book, was the concept of “maximum sustainable yield” (MSY), used by Latin American politicians who objected to the expansion of U.S. tuna fisheries into what later became their exclusive economic zones (EEZs), long before MSY became quantifiable.

What an amazed reader discovers on page 94 of Finley’s book is that Chapman documented his concept via a tall Gaussian curve in a graph with an abscissa labeled “Sustained Intensity of Fishing” and with “Catch of Fish” as an ordinate. MSY was the then the peak of the curve, and it was an unpardonable waste to be fishing near its left tail. Scant attention was given what would happen when the “intensity of fishing” went past that required for MSY, toward the right tail. Indeed, Chapman hardly bothered to elaborate on this, except for asserting that Japan would surely over-exploit salmon in Alaska. MSY, however, could not have been estimated at the time it was proposed in this Gaussian form in 1948: it was just a tawdry trick, pulled by Chapman and his acolytes in defense of what was then perceived as of the interests of the U.S. fishing industry.

Finley then shows how the MSY concept became the basis of international fisheries policy—small wonder that fisheries are now globally in trouble.

DANIEL PAULY, *Fisheries Centre, University of British Columbia, Vancouver, British Columbia, Canada*

AN ENTIRELY SYNTHETIC FISH: HOW RAINBOW TROUT BEGUILLED AMERICA AND OVERRAN THE WORLD.

By Anders Halverson. New Haven (Connecticut): Yale University Press. \$17.00 (paper). xxi + 257 p.; ill.; index. ISBN: 978-0-300-14087-3. 2010.

The title of this highly readable book is only a slight exaggeration of how rainbow trout became one of the most popular and widespread fish in the world. There are few coldwater streams that this fish does not inhabit, even in the tropics, and it is the basis for a major aquaculture industry, as well as fisheries.

Halverson treats the history of rainbow trout like a detective story and interviews or writes about a cast of fascinating characters. The story weaves in the history of trout aquaculture, the complex taxonomic history of rainbow trout, and the ever-changing attitudes toward angling. I loved his descriptions of how fishing became an aristocratic or even patriotic activity in the 19th century, with trout being almost the only fish worthy of capture by gentlemen. But the best parts of this volume are the descriptions of biologists working in the field to solve problems such as how to stock fish in mountain lakes (by airplane) and then how to get rid of trout from these same lakes (because of their impact on native frogs). One chapter is devoted to the largely forgotten story of the massive attempt to poison (with rotenone) the Green River to get rid of native fishes in order to make more room for game fish such as rainbow trout. The hero of this particular story is Robert Rush Miller, who opposed the poisoning and helped make it a springboard for promotion of native fish conservation.

In short, this brief book is an excellent and entertaining read for anyone interested in the history of conservation, but especially the history of how rainbow trout became an entirely synthetic fish.

PETER B. MOYLE, *Wildlife, Fish & Conservation Biology, University of California, Davis, California*

INLAND FISHERIES MANAGEMENT IN NORTH AMERICA. *Third Edition.*

Edited by Wayne A. Hubert and Michael C. Quist. Bethesda (Maryland): American Fisheries Society. \$104.00. xxiii + 780 p.; ill.; index. ISBN: 978-1-934874-16-5. 2010.

North America contains a remarkable diversity of temperate freshwater fishes, many of which are managed for commercial and recreational activities. The goal of the third edition of this book is to provide an updated reference on “the past and emerging conceptual basis and evolving practices for managing freshwater fisheries in North America” (p. xxi). Although this volume should be a useful reference for fisheries managers, the editors acknowledge that the intended audience is undergraduate and graduate