FDA Citizen’s Petition

Reclassification of the Sunscreen Actives Oxybenzone, Octinoxate and Octocrylene from Category III (More Data Needed) to Category II (Not Safe for Human Use) &

Removal of Products Containing Oxybenzone, Octinoxate and Octocrylene from the Marketplace Based on their Dangers to Public Health and Negative Ecological Impact to US Virgin Islands, Hawaii, California, Florida and other Coastal Areas and Waterways

The undersigned submits this petition under CFR 10.30 of the Federal Food Drug and Cosmetic Act for which authority has been delegated to the Commissioner of Food and Drugs to request the Commissioner of Food and Drugs to enforce the reclassification of oxybenzone, octinoxate and octocrylene from the over-the-counter (OTC) sunscreen monograph drug status of Category III “insufficient data for use in sunscreens” to Category II “Not Generally Recognized as Safe & Effective” for human use. AND to remove all sunscreen products containing oxybenzone, octinoxate and octocrylene from the marketplace based on these chemicals' health risks and negative impact to waterways and coastlines including those in the US Virgin Islands, Hawaii, California, Florida and other Coastal Areas and Waterways.

A. Action Requested

On behalf of the undersigned government representatives, academics, businesses, and environmental groups encompassing several thousands of citizens from the US Virgin Islands, Hawaii, California and Florida we request that the FDA ban the use of the “Toxic 3 Os,” namely oxybenzone, octinoxate and octocrylene, in OTC sunscreen drugs and re-designate them as Category II “Not Recognized as Safe & Effective (GRASE) for use in sunscreens” from their current status of Category III “Insufficient Data for Use in Sunscreens.” This includes the recall of all such products from the marketplace. Only active ingredients deemed Generally Recognized as Safe & Effective (GRASE, Category 1), which include zinc oxide and titanium dioxide (mineral sunscreens), should be permitted.

B. Statement of Grounds

Extensive published research demonstrates that oxybenzone, octinoxate and octocrylene, active ingredients present in more than 2/3 of all sunscreens, pose a threat to public health, marine life and coral reefs\(^1,2\). This includes the latest studies earlier this year showing that octocrylene in sun protection products degrades into benzophenone, a known carcinogen that also can interfere with key hormones and reproductive organs\(^3\). Additionally, a major manufacturer of sunscreens has voluntarily decided to discontinue sales of the active octocrylene to its customers\(^4\).

Although in February 2019, the FDA published a notice in the Federal Register removing 14 organic sunscreen actives from the GRASE Category I list “because the public record does not currently contain sufficient data to support positive GRASE determinations,” it is now time to once
and for all ensure that all sunscreen products are safe for both people and the environment and remove those that are not. Sunscreens, along with ultraviolet protective clothing (UPF), hats, sunglasses and avoiding direct sun during peak hours, are critical in protecting people against the harmful effects of UV radiation. But, if the public cannot have confidence that their sunscreens are safe, the FDA has not done its job. Currently only the mineral barriers zinc and titanium dioxide are considered GRASE, but thousands of sunscreen products containing the “Toxic 3 Os” are on the market and widely used.

The “Toxic 3 Os” have been shown to destroy coral and cause health risks to people and marine life. They cause human cell damage that has been linked to cancer, disrupt hormones, have been found in breast milk, blood and urine and are known allergens. Likewise, these chemicals are devastating to coral reefs and marine life. They wash off people’s bodies when they swim and contaminate through waste water runoff and cause ‘zombie’ coral which looks healthy but is unable to reproduce, coral bleaching as well as other issues. Coral reefs take up less than one percent of the ocean floor but are home to more than twenty-five percent of marine life. They are vital to protecting coastlines and supporting life in oceans and have the highest biodiversity of any of the planet’s ecosystems. Oxybenzone is particularly toxic to corals at concentrations as low as a few parts per trillion — the equivalent of three drops in an Olympic-size swimming pool may be enough to severely damage or kill coral. The “Toxic 3 Os” can also infiltrate to humans when there is fishing in contaminated waters.

The Personal Care Product Industry has had over 40 years to demonstrate the safety and efficacy of the “Toxic 3 Os” and the other Soluble Organic UV Filters (SOUVF) listed in the Agency's docket on the 2019 proposed rule “Sunscreen Drug Products for Over-the-Counter Human Use.” Instead, the FDA affirmed that after decades of peer reviewed published literature on the safety and efficacy of the SOUVF group, there is still insufficient data in the public record to support a positive designation of GRASE.

Meanwhile, the weight of evidence, built over at least the last twenty years of research and hundreds of peer-reviewed scientific articles, demonstrates that oxybenzone, octinoxate, octocrylene and other SOUVF in Category III are toxic to humans, corals and other animals.

The SOUVF are structural and functional analogues to human estrogen, pesticides like DDT, BPA (Bisphenol A), phthalates, atrazine and glyphosate (Roundup), parabens, and other known hormone disruptors. They will never be found to be GRASE or environmentally safe because they aren’t. No amount of further research can change their chemical nature. We therefore urge the FDA to apply the Precautionary Principle that the burden of proof for potentially harmful actions by industry or government rests on the assurance of safety and that when there are threats of serious damage, scientific uncertainty must be resolved in favor of prevention.
C. Environmental Impact
Although no formal environmental impact studies are being submitted with this petition, there have been multiple studies demonstrating that oxybenzone, octinoxate and octocrylene adversely impact the environment, particularly the coastlines and waterways of USVI, Hawaii, California, Florida and throughout the United States. This impacts both marine life and coral.

According to the National Oceanic and Atmospheric Administration (NOAA)\textsuperscript{16}, there is scientific evidence indicating that oxybenzone and chemicals like it are deadly to coral and threaten overall reef health. They cause coral bleaching, harm – and eventually kill - coral larvae by damaging DNA, and act as endocrine disruptors. We have already lost 50% of coral reefs worldwide (80% in the Caribbean) due to pollution and a variety of other issues. We can’t afford to lose more. NOAA Scientist Cheryl Woodley cautions: “While additional research may incrementally add to our understanding of its impacts to additional coral reef species, additional research on the impacts of oxybenzone should not be a prerequisite to management action.”

Downs identifies the environmental impact that oxybenzone and octinoxate have on navigable water ways whose biological/ecological receptors and structures can be impacted by sunscreens as a result of waste-water discharge (point and non-point sources), swimmer contamination, and/or from aerosol spray discharges from boaters and inflatable and rigid personal crafts (e.g., inflatable tubes, canoes, kayaks, paddle boards), all from the use of over-the-counter sunscreen SPF products. Contamination of these 851 bodies of waters in 21 States threaten subsistence fishers and USDA and National Marine Fisheries Service recognized fisheries in all the states listed below\textsuperscript{2}.

State of California (59 rivers and lakes); State of Colorado (9 rivers); State of Connecticut (36 rivers and lakes); State of Delaware 22 rivers and creeks); State of Hawaii (13 rivers and streams); State of Illinois (58 rivers and lakes); State of Indiana (37 rivers and lakes); State of Maine (30 rivers); State of Maryland (33 rivers and lakes); State of Massachusetts (35 rivers); State of Michigan (30 rivers); State of Montana (30 rivers); State of New Mexico (9 rivers); State of New York (37 rivers and lakes); State of Ohio (50 rivers and lakes); State of Oregon (124 rivers and lakes); State of Rhode Island (39 rivers); State of South Carolina (30 rivers); State of Virginia (40 rivers); State of Washington (100 rivers and lakes); State of Wisconsin (30 rivers).

Additionally, Downs also identifies the following 235 protected species at risk in the US: marine mammals (10); reptiles (8); birds (16); Bivalves (26); crustaceans (28); fish (140) and coral (7).

D. Economic Impact
No formal economic impact studies are being submitted with this petition; however, it should be noted that the financial cost associated with treating the impact to both human health and the environment will be significant. Additionally, negative impacts to the tourism industry, the economic lifeblood of many coastal regions, could be significant if there isn’t a focus on
sustainable, ecologically sound practices such as safe sunscreen. Likewise, the fishing industry could be decimated if toxins are allowed to continue pouring into our waterways unchecked.

E. Certification
The undersigned certifies that, to the best knowledge and belief of the undersigned, this petition includes all information and views on which the petition relies, and that it includes representative data and information known to the petitioner which are unfavorable to the petition.

Harith Wickrema & Joe DiNardo (Signing for ALL signatories - attached)
Harith Wickrema & Joe DiNardo (Name of petitioners)
President Island Green Living Association & Personal Care Products Toxicologist
PO Box 80; St John USVI 00831 & 6920 Irish Creek Road, Vesuvius VA 24483 (Mailing address)
215 620-8809 & 540 377-2932 (Telephone number)

References:
2) Downs Environmental Impact Study: Oxybenzone and Octinoxate - Submitted to FDA July 14, 2021
4) BASF Discontinuation of Uvinul® N 539T (Octocrylene) - Letter Dated 06/25/2021
Signatories

Senator Mike Gabbard
Hawai‘i State Senate

Senator Chris Lee
Hawai‘i State Senate

Senator Janelle K. Sarauw
US Virgin Islands

Senator Marvin A. Blyden
US Virgin Islands

Senator Steven D. Payne Sr.
US Virgin Islands

Representative Gene Ward, PhD
Minority Leader Emeritus
Hawai‘i House of Representatives

Representative Nicole Lowen
Hawai‘i House of Representatives

Teri Johnson
Mayor; On behalf of the City of Key West

Kevin Rodriguez
Deputy Chief of Staff
US Virgin Islands Governor

Maxx Phillips, Esq.
Hawai‘i Director and Staff Attorney
Center for Biological Diversity

Katie Day
Environmental Science and Policy Manager
Surfrider Foundation
Lisa Bishop  
Hawai’i Coral Reef Stakeholders Hui  
On behalf of eminent scientists and over one thousand concerned citizens from over 50 organizations and businesses advocating for the best stewardship of endangered marine ecosystems

Ted Bohlen  
Hawai’a Reef and Ocean Coalition  
On behalf of coral reef scientists, educators, local Hawai’i environmental organizations, elected officials and others who address the crisis facing fragile marine environments

Dr. David Hall, President  
University of the Virgin Islands (UVI)

Dr. Paul Jobsis, Ph.D  
Acting Director of the Center for Marine & Environmental Studies  
Associate Professor of Biology and Research Administrator III  
UVI College of Science and Mathematics

Jane Williams  
Executive Director  
California Communities Against Toxics

Cindi Punihaole  
Executive Director  
Kahalu’u Bay Education Center

Lisa Bishop  
President  
Friends of Hanauma Bay

Melodie Aduja  
Alan Burdick  
Co-chairs  
Environmental Caucus  
Democratic Party of Hawai’i

Pat B. Lindquist  
President  
Napili Bay & Beach Foundation, Inc.
Kurt Lieber
Founder and President
Ocean Defenders Alliance

Mendy Dant
Executive Vice President
Fair Wind Cruises

Rick Gaffney
Hawaii Fishing & Boating Association

Elizabeth Reilly
Livable Hawaii Kai Hui

Doug Harper
Executive Director
Malama Maunalua

Nicole Roy
Long Term Recovery Project Coordinator
Emergency Disaster Services
The Salvation Army
Puerto Rico & US Virgin Islands Division

Dr. Kim Waddell, Ph.D
Project Director, VI-EPSCoR
UVI & Project Lead for a FEMA-funded Hazard Mitigation and Resilience Plan Update for the USVI

Mark Lichtenstein
Chief of Staff and Chief Sustainability Officer
President’s Office
SUNY College of Environmental Science and Forestry (ESF)

Dr. Greg Guannel, Ph.D
Director
Caribbean Green Technology Center, UVI

Dr. David Minner
Iowa State University EARTH Program
Wednesday, September 8, 2021

Andy Rutnik  
Chairman  
Friends of the VI National Park

Tonia Lovejoy  
Executive Director  
Friends of the VI National Park

Bill Coney  
Co-founder  
Legacy Reef Foundation

Mill McCleary  
Executive Program Director  
Reef Relief

Christine Zalewski, PhD  
Silver Spiral Seas, LLC

Wilkie McClaren  
Safe Sunscreen Coalition

Wilkie McClaren  
Ban Toxic Sunscreens

Mark Okrusko  
Airtime Watertime, Inc.

Iris Kahaulelio  
Aloha Surfing Ohana

Caren Loebel-Fried  
www.carenloebelfried.com

Rosalyn & Michael  
Little Hands Hawaii

Ray Hollowell  
Sea Inspiration
Wednesday, September 8, 2021

Stuart Coleman
Executive Director
WAI: Wastewater Alternatives & Innovations

Florin Moisan Nica
Koko Beach Rentals

Florin Moisan Nica
Hanauma Bay Snorkel Adventures

David DiGiacomo
Vice President
Island Green Living Association

Kelly Lawson
Executive Director
Island Green Living Association

Akhil Deshwal
Managing Director
Gallows Point Resort

Bill White
Waialea Community Association

Lynn White
Puako Community Association

Mike Nakachi
Moana Ohana

Christy Johnson
Nudi Wear

Caroline Duell
All Good

LorMona Meredith
P2P Project Manager/Volunteer Liaison
Polynesian Voyaging Society
Wednesday, September 8, 2021

Randy Thurman
Board of Directors
Island Green Living Association

Curtis Penn
Board of Directors
Island Green Living Association

Ralph Antolino Jr.
Board of Directors
Island Green Living Association

D. A. Aldridge
President
Last Stand