

# VISION IAS™

www.visionias.in  
www.visionias.wordpress.com

VISION IAS  
M N 31 OCT 2014 No. 3  
RECEIVED

## GENERAL STUDIES (Test Code : 417)

Name of Candidate	Pavan Agrawal	Registration No.	1649
Schedule	'B' flexible	Module	152
Place	M/N	Time	1:30 PM
Date	31/11/2014		
Classroom	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Distance Learning	<input type="checkbox"/>
Classroom & Distance Learning		<input type="checkbox"/>	

### INDEX TABLE

Q. No.	Maximum Marks	Marks Obtained
1	10	
2	10	
3	10	
4	10	
5	10	
6	10	
7	10	
8	10	
9	10	
10	10	
11	10	
12	10	
13	5	
14	25	
15	20	
16	20	
17	20	
18	15	
19	10	
20	15	

Total Marks Obtained

Remarks:

Signature of Examiner

### INSTRUCTIONS

- Do furnish the appropriate details in the answer sheet (viz. Name, ID Number and Test Code).  
उत्तर-पुस्तिका में सूचनाएं भरना आवश्यक है (नाम, प्रश्न-पत्र कोड, विद्यार्थी क्रमांक नम्बर आदि।
- There are TWENTY-FIVE questions printed both in HINDI and in ENGLISH.  
इसमें पच्चीस प्रश्न हैं तथा हिन्दी और अंग्रेजी दोनों में छपे हैं।
- All questions are compulsory.  
सभी प्रश्न अनिवार्य हैं।
- The number of marks carried by a question/part is indicated against it.  
प्रत्येक प्रश्न/भाग के अंक उसके सामने दिए गए हैं।
- Answers must be written in the medium authorized in the Admission Certificate, which must be stated clearly on the cover of this Question-cum-Answer (QCA) Booklet in the space provided. No marks will be given for answers written in medium other than the authorized one.  
प्रश्नों के उत्तर उसी माध्यम में लिखे जाने चाहिए जिसका उल्लेख आपके प्रवेश-पत्र में किया गया है और उस माध्यम का स्पष्ट उल्लेख प्रश्न-सह-उत्तर (क्यू.सी.ए.) पुस्तिका के मुख-पृष्ठ पर अंकित निर्दिष्ट स्थान पर किया जाना चाहिए। उल्लिखित माध्यम के अतिरिक्त अन्य किसी माध्यम में लिए गए उत्तर पर कोई अंक नहीं मिलेंगे।
- Word limit in questions, if specified, should be adhered to.  
प्रश्नों में शब्द सीमा, जहाँ विनिर्दिष्ट है, का अनुसरण किया जाना चाहिए।
- Any page or portion of the page left blank in the Question-cum-Answer Booklet must be clearly struck off.  
उत्तर-पुस्तिका में खाली छोड़ा हुआ पृष्ठ या उसके अंश को स्पष्ट रूप से काटा जाना चाहिए।

103, 1<sup>st</sup> Floor B/1-2, Ansal Building, Behind UCO Bank, Dr. Mukherjee Nagar, Delhi-09

75, 3<sup>rd</sup> Floor, Old Rajinder Nagar Market, Near Axis Bank, New Delhi - 110060

## **GENERAL STUDIES (Test Code : 417)**

- Overall Macro comments / feedback / suggestions on Answer Booklet:

1.

2.

3.

4.

5.

**All The Best**



## Section A

Answer the following questions in not more than the word limit specified for each in the parenthesis:

1. Are all professions morally equivalent or are some superior to others? (150 words)

10

क्या सभी व्यवसाय नैतिक दृष्टि से समान होते हैं या कुछ अन्य से श्रेष्ठ होते हैं?

Ans→

For a profession to be better than the other, it is necessary that it must serve a higher social purpose. The professions which serve no social purpose should not be considered good. For example → killing by Armed forces for the defence of the nation ~~may~~ should be considered better than a professional assassin, though both are killing.

Also there are professions which have benefits only for selected few but negatives for many and society in general

for example drug and human trafficking, organ trade and Narcotics. Here the purpose is also important. trading in drugs for medicinal purpose is better than for addiction.

However as far as Indian Varnashrama is considered, they all have their social utility. Also it should be by action not birth.

Gita talks about following one's duty in any of the profession. It talks about excelling in it thus keeping all professions at equal level.

In this light all professions can only be judged according

to their social utility. ~~These~~  
It is difficult to grade the  
professions. However they can  
be divided between desirable  
and undesirable depending  
upon their social utility.

2. How are ethical judgments different from judgments of personal preference, taste, or prejudice? (150 words) 10  
नैतिक निर्णय किस प्रकार से व्यक्तिगत प्राथमिकता/वरीयता, रुचि अथवा पूर्वाग्रह से भिन्न होते हैं?







3. What are the major ethical concerns governing the functioning of government organisations? How are they different from those in private organisations? (150 words) 10

सरकारी संगठनों की कार्य-पद्धति के संचालन से संबंधित प्रमुख नैतिक चिन्ताएं क्या हैं?  
ये निजी संगठनों से किस प्रकार भिन्न हैं?

Ans →

government organisations work for the public. Their main concern is benefit of public. They have responsibility towards the elected representatives who in turn are responsible to people.

Thus main ethical concern for public organisations are benefit of public, equity etc.

They are different from private.

① Private organisation work for main motive of profit whereas public organisation work for



larger social purpose. Eg  
setting up of Bhilai steel  
plant to bridge regional  
imbalances.

② Private organisations are  
responsible only towards the  
stakeholders whereas public  
organisations are responsible to  
people at large.

4. What is corporate governance? How is it important in the Indian corporate sector? How will the mandatory provision of corporate social responsibility change the perception of private sector in the eyes of common man? (150 words) 10
- कार्पोरेट गवर्नेंस (Corporate governance) क्या है? भारतीय कार्पोरेट क्षेत्रों में यह किस प्रकार से महत्वपूर्ण है? कार्पोरेट सामाजिक जिम्मेदारी (Corporate social responsibility) के अनिवार्य प्रावधान, सामान्य लोगों की नजर में निजी क्षेत्र की धारणा को किस प्रकार बदलेगा?

Ans Corporate governance is business management practice which focusses on all aspects including its finances, its people and its environment. Thus it balances

Corporate governance is business management practice safeguarding the interests of the stakeholders.

It includes following the law of the land and ensuring maximum transparency.

Corporate governance is important for Indian corporates for following reasons.

- ① This eliminates or reduces the probability of frauds and scams. eg. Satyam and NSEL crisis.
- ② It increases the investor confidence. Thus firms with better corporate governance attract better investment.
- ③ Transparency helps in building brand image and better market prospects.



The mandatory corporate social responsibility provisions will help change <sup>(CSR)</sup> perception among common man -

- ① Common men's perception is that private firms operate only for profit. This will change as CSR focusses on economic, social and environmental aspect.
- ② It will provide an opportunity for common people to participate along side corporate. People would be able to benefit from their projects. It will help overcome the resistance by people among many parts of country.

5. B. R. Ambedkar was an ardent supporter of the claims of liberty, equality and fraternity. Explain the relevance of his teaching in modern day India and how they act as a backbone for our socio-political development. (150 words)

10

बी. आर. अम्बेडकर स्वतंत्रता, समानता और बंधुता के दावों के प्रबल समर्थक थे। आधुनिक काल में उनकी शिक्षाओं की प्रासंगिकता की व्याख्या कीजिये और ये किस प्रकार से हमारे सामाजिक-राजनीतिक विकास के लिए आधारशिला हैं?

Ans:

B.R. Ambedkar was an ardent supporter of fundamental liberties and absence of discrimination. His ideas are still relevant in following ways.

① The idea of liberty and equality are still important in light of discrimination against women, children, minorities, scheduled tribes and castes and other marginalised sections.

② As India is facing communal tensions in different parts of the country, the idea of fraternity is important. It can instill feeling of brotherhood.

so that we can become agents of change and development.

- 3) Dr Ambedkar talked about annihilation of caste. It is important that all the disabilities arising from the system of caste are eradicated. Everyone must be provided an equal opportunity to develop to his/her best potential.



6. As the interaction and collaboration among the nations is continuously increasing, so is the number of ethical issues between them on the global arena? Justify with examples. (150 words) 10
- जैसे-जैसे राष्ट्रों के बीच पारस्परिक अंतःक्रिया और सहयोग लगातार बढ़ रहा है, उसी क्रम में वैश्विक परिदृश्य में उनके मध्य नैतिक मुद्दों की संख्या बढ़ रही है। उदाहरण के साथ औचित्य सिद्ध कीजिए।

Ans →

~~Globalised world~~  
Globalisation has increased the pace of interaction and also the interdependence among the nations. This has brought to light many of the ethical issues. This can be understood by following examples-

① Rising violence in many parts of the world, has from time to time <sup>has</sup> raised the question whether it is right to intervene in ~~the~~ a sovereign nation to protect human rights. This has been seen in many cases from Libya, Syria, Iraq etc.

② Growing deadly diseases and their rapid transportation also brings in light many ethical questions. a) Whether it is right to use the medicines which have not completed clinical trial?  
b) whether it is ok to close the borders for people from other countries.

③ Violence has also created the

problem of refugees. This is expected to further rise.

Recent incident of boat capsizing in mediterranean sea bring up the question that what are human rights of refugees?

④ worsening economic disparity, climate change negotiations etc also raise the question that what should be responsibility of individual nations.



7. While it is important to expose a wrongdoing, a whistleblower should have the moral backing behind his act of whistleblowing. Comment. (150 words)

10

यद्यपि एक गलत कार्य को उद्घाटित करना महत्वपूर्ण है तथापि व्हीसलब्लोवर के अपने इस कार्य के पीछे नैतिक आधार भी होना चाहिए।

Ans→

Whistleblowing is an act of exposing any financial or other wrong in an organisation. It can be done by a person belonging to the organisation or outside person.

By exposing wrong doing it helps serve the public interest, which makes this desirable. It ~~How~~ also leads to better confidence among the masses. It also acts as a deterrent against the wrong doing.

However there has to be a moral backing behind the act of whistleblowing. The whistleblower has a genuine responsibility

to keep the organisational information secret. So the whistleblowing should be done only for genuine public interesting rather than for settling scores or over difference of opinion.

Second point is regarding courage required for the act. Courage is among the four cardinal virtues. ~~However~~ Socrates put courage between cowardice and rashness. Thus it is important that the whistle blower exhausts all other options to correct the wrong before whistleblowing. He must not act in rashness.

Thus it is important to have backing for this act.



8. Integrity is different from honesty and is probably the most important attribute for a Civil Servant. Elaborate. (150 words) 10
- सत्यनिष्ठा ईमानदारी से भिन्न होती है और संभवतः यह एक सिविल सेवक के लिए सबसे बड़ा गुण होता है। विस्तार से बताइए।

Ans Honesty is limited to financial and money matters. It is about maintaining financial propriety. However integrity is more broad based. It includes honesty but it goes beyond that.

Integrity is about being true in every sense. It includes



intellectual honesty also.

Integrity is very important  
for civil servants because they  
have to take many decisions  
based on discretion. In absence  
of rules and procedures, it  
is the integrity of civil  
servant which comes to his/  
her aid to reach to a better  
decision.

Integrity helps build the  
character of civil servant. It  
builds trust and reputation  
among fellow workers as  
well as masses. This reputation  
helps in participative develop-  
ment and ~~extra~~ inclusive  
development.

Efficiency is also better  
achieved by a person with

*integrity. He/she will give  
his full effort and will  
motivate others also.*

9. Colleges and schools are a microcosm of the real world. Elaborate as to how these are instrumental in character-building. Also suggest certain measures through which these institutions can play a greater role in the current scenario. (150 words)

10

विद्यालय और कॉलेज वास्तविक जगत के सूक्ष्म रूप होते हैं। चरित्र निर्माण में ये किस प्रकार से सहायक होते हैं? विस्तार से बताइये। इसके अलावा कुछ उपायों को भी सुझाइये जिसके द्वारा वर्तमान परिदृश्य में इन संस्थाओं की वृहद् भूमिका सुनिश्चित की जा सके।

Ans

Colleges and schools are very important in building of character. Schools and colleges provide opportunity to interact with fellow students (who represent various sections of society). They also impart education.

Schools and colleges help in process of socialisation. Here the student learn about the good values and bad values. They understand importance of character.

Teachers also tell about good practices, lessons from lives of great personalities and also from their own character.



the students learn about right virtues.

As gandhiji have said the purpose of education is to build character, there is need to take many steps for it.

① Rather than focussing on rote learning, activity based learning should be provided. so that students can learn about better values.

② Intra school visits and visits to places like hospitals, orphanages etc should be promoted so that students can learn to empathise.

③ Promotion of sports can also help in development of leadership, teamwork and coordination.

10. Gandhi's compassion towards the weaker sections makes him different from other social reformers. What are the lessons that it conveys? Discuss a situation where you have shown compassion towards weaker sections of the society. (150 words)

10

कमजोर वर्गों के प्रति गाँधी जी का करुणा भाव उन्हें अन्य सामाजिक सुधारकों से अलग करता है। इससे हमें क्या शिक्षा मिलती है? एक ऐसी स्थिति की चर्चा कीजिए जब अपने समाज के कमजोर वर्गों के प्रति करुणा दिखाई थी।

Ans → Grandhiji had compassion towards the weaker sections i.e. women, untouchables etc. Though other reformers also worked for these sections, Grandhi provided renewed impetus for the upliftment of these sections.

- ~~Grandhi called~~

Based on Grandhi's work we get the message of valuing every individual equally. This provides basis for inclusive development.

I showed compassion towards weaker sections by going to teach in a nearby blind school. I used to read lessons for them. It was a very fulfilling exercise.





11. While individual beliefs and values determine one's subjective responsibility, it is the operational environment which guides/shapes the objective responsibility. Congruence between the two is inevitable for realizing the goal of objectivity in administrative decisions. Analyse. (150 words) 10

व्यक्तिगत मान्यताएं और मूल्य एक व्यक्ति की आत्मनिष्ठ उत्तरदायित्व को निर्धारित करते हैं, जबकि कार्यात्मक (operational) पर्यावरण वस्तुनिष्ठ उत्तरदायित्व को आकार देता है/निर्देशित करता है। दोनों के बीच अनुरूपता प्रशासनिक निर्णयों में वस्तुनिष्ठता के लक्ष्य को साकार करने के लिए अपरिहार्य है। विश्लेषण कीजिए।

Ans

Operational environment refers to the facts of the matter. There are the situations which are defined in rules and regulations. This leads to objective responsibility.

However many a times administrators have to take decisions based on discretion for which no rules and regulations are not there. In such a situation, he/she will have to depend on his/individual <sub>her</sub>

beliefs and values. This determine his subjective responsibility.

In other words subjective responsibility is towards his/her conscience whereas objective responsibility is towards the rules/regulations.

Synergy among both is required to achieve the goal of objectivity in administrative decisions.



12. "Indian constitution is a treasure trove of ethical values for civil servants." Illustrate. (150 words) 10  
 "भारतीय संविधान सिविल सेवकों के लिए नैतिक मूल्यों की निधि (कोष) है"। वर्णन कीजिए।

Ans

Indian constitution provides the ethical values for civil servants.

The values of justice, equality, ~~affor~~ liberty, fraternity, secularism guide the civil servants.

Indian constitution particularly its preamble, directive principles,

fundamental rights and fundamental duties are source of ethical values. It can be understood in following examples.

- ① The values of equality of status and opportunity ~~and~~ is a guidance to civil servants so that they treat everyone equally and also have empathy towards the weaker sections.
- ② The directive principles talk about taking care of the environment and other life forms. These values are very important to achieve the goal of sustainable development.
- ③ The values of secularism is important in a country as diverse as India.





13. What are values? How are they different from ethics? (100 words)  
मूल्य क्या होते हैं? ये नैतिकता से किस प्रकार भिन्न हैं?

5

Ans→

~~Values are internal, their source~~  
Values are ideas that we hold very dear to ourselves. These are different from ethics -

- ① Values are internal, they depend on particular person. Whereas ethics are external they are for a community.
- ② Values do not change by change of place ~~etc~~, profession etc whereas ethics may change depending on community.
- ③ Values are subjective and ethics are objective.

## Section B

In the following questions, carefully study the cases presented and then answer the questions that follow (in around 250 words):

निम्नलिखित प्रश्नों में, प्रस्तुत मामलों का अध्ययन ध्यान से कीजिए और उसके बाद पूछे गए प्रश्नों का उत्तर दीजिए (लगभग 250 शब्दों में):

14. You are judging a high profile case of a rich businessman who is accused of holding back money of numerous investors in the country. You are facing tremendous pressure from politicians and an industrial lobby, asking you to be lenient towards the businessman as he has created close to a million jobs in the country and his bad reputation will be disastrous for the economy. The following are some suggested options. Please evaluate the merits and demerits of each of the options:

- A. Ask the senior judge to transfer you from the case.
- B. Ignore all the pressure tactics by various groups completely.
- C. Increase the duration of the court hearing to soothe down the pressure.
- D. Hold the case in abeyance and ask for an inquiry report from the regulatory body.
- E. Ask the media to stop reporting the case with such fanfare.

Also indicate (without necessarily restricting to the above options), what would you advise, giving proper reasons. 25

आप एक ऐसे धनी व्यवसाय के उच्च स्तरीय केस की सुनवाई कर रहे हैं, जिस पर देश के कई निवेशकों का पैसा हड़पने का आरोप है। आप राजनेताओं और औद्योगिक लॉबी की तरफ से अत्यधिक दबाव झेल रहे हैं, जो आपसे उद्योगपति की तरफ उदार होने के लिए कह रहे हैं, क्योंकि उसने देश में लगभग लाखों की संख्या में रोजगार उत्पन्न किये हैं और उसकी बुरी छवि से अर्थव्यवस्था को भारी नुकसान पहुँचेगा।



कुछ वैकल्पिक सुझाव नीचे दिये गये हैं। कृपया सभी विकल्पों के गुणों और दोषों का मूल्यांकन करें:

- वरिष्ठ न्यायाधीशों से खुद को इस केस से स्थानांतरण के लिए कहेंगे।
- विभिन्न समूहों की सभी दबाव रणनीतियों को पूर्ण रूप से अनदेखा कर देंगे।
- दबाव को शांत करने हेतु, न्यायालय की सुनवाई की अवधि में वृद्धि कर देंगे।
- केस को ठंडे बस्ते में डाल देंगे और नियामक संस्था को जाँच के लिए कहेंगे।
- मीडिया को इस केस को जोर-शोर से दिखाने से रोकेंगे।

इसके साथ ही यह भी इंगित करें कि (सिर्फ ऊपर दिए गए विकल्पों तक सीमित न रहते हुए) आपकी क्या सलाह है, उचित तर्क भी प्रस्तुत करें।

Ans-

The situation given has various stakeholders including the investors, the workers, politicians, industrialists etc. I am facing pressure from all quarters, in such case it is important to consider the given alternatives one by one.

ask  
@ To ~~ask~~ senior judge to transfer myself from the cases will be running from duty and evanion of responsibility. All the schools of ethics talk about following the duty including virta and deontology. From utilitarian perspective also it will have bad consequences for the



economy. On personal level also this will lead to bad reputation.

② Ignoring all pressure tactics completely

Completely ignoring everyone will be a too extreme step. In this ~~case~~ I have to choose the middle path between giving to pressure and completely ignoring it. Better step will be to take care of legitimate interests like safeguarding interests of workers etc.

③ Increasing duration of court hearing to soothe down pressure → This step may help to relieve the pressure or not. However wasting court's time unnecessarily will lead to erosion of faith of the masses in the judicial system. It may

also lead to lack of time for disposal of other genuine case requiring the attention of the court. This is particularly significant in light of high burden of cases faced by Indian judiciary.

④ Holding case in abeyance and asking for inquiry report from regulatory body → The report of inquiry can be sought from regulatory body. It can provide an expert opinion about the facts of matter. However the message should not be that it looks like evasion of duty.

Thus there is need to continue the proceeding while asking for report



(c) Asking media to report the case with such fanfare will be against freedom of speech of the media and it will also be against right to information of investors in particular and public in general. However media should be instructed to report only factual information and speculation should not be allowed. An official can also be decided to provide media with credible and genuine information.

Thus there is need of a balanced approach where the legitimate interests can be served without compromising on the front of justice.



15. Jyoti Gupta is the environmental compliance manager for a small plastics manufacturing company. She is currently faced with a dilemma on whether or not to spend money on a new technology that will reduce the level of a particular toxin in the wastewater that flows out from the back of the factory into a lake.

The factory's emission levels are already within legal limits. However, Jyoti knows that environmental regulations for this particular toxin are lagging behind scientific evidence. In fact, a scientist from the university had been quoted in the newspaper recently, saying that if emission levels stayed at this level, the fish in the lake and rivers in the area might soon have to be declared unsafe for human consumption.

Further, if companies in the region don't engage in some self-regulation on this issue, there is reason to fear that the government — backed by public opinion — may force companies to begin using the new technology, and may also begin requiring monthly emission level reports (which would be both expensive and time consuming).

But the company's environmental compliance budget is tight. Asking for this new technology to be installed would put Jyoti's department over-budget, and could jeopardize the company's ability to show a profit this year.

The following are some suggested options. Please evaluate the merits and demerits of each of the options:

1. Jyoti should focus on her company's financial performance and profits and forget the environmental issue as the compliance budget is already tight.
2. As the emission levels of the company are within legal limits, Jyoti should wait for new governmental regulations first and only after that should think about taking any action.
3. Jyoti should proactively report the matter to the higher management and ensure proper measures are taken but still profits of the company should receive the utmost priority.

Also indicate (without necessarily restricting to the above options), what would you advise, giving proper reasons.

20

ज्योति गुप्ता एक छोटी प्लास्टिक विनिर्माण कंपनी की पर्यावरण अनुपालन प्रबंधक (environmental compliance manager) है। वर्तमान में वह एक दुविधा से गुजर रही है कि उन्हें एक ऐसी नयी तकनीक पर धन खर्च करना चाहिए या नहीं जिससे कि अपशिष्ट जल में एक विशेष विषैले पदार्थ के स्तर में कमी लायी जा सकती है जो कि कारखाने के पीछे से एक झील में मिलता है।

कारखाने का उत्सर्जन स्तर पहले से ही कानूनी दायरे के अंदर है। यद्यपि, ज्योति को पता है कि इस विषाक्त पदार्थ के उत्सर्जन संबंधी कानून वैज्ञानिक प्रमाण से अभिपुष्ट नहीं हैं। यहाँ तक कि हाल में ही विश्वविद्यालय के एक वैज्ञानिक ने एक समाचार पत्र में उद्धरित



किया है कि यदि उत्सर्जन का स्तर यही रहा तो उस क्षेत्र की नदियों और झीलों में पायी जाने वाली मछलियों को मनुष्यों के खाने के लिए असुरक्षित घोषित करनी पड़ेगी। पुनः यदि उस क्षेत्र की कंपनियाँ इस विषय में स्व-नियमन के कदम नहीं उठाती हैं, तो पर्याप्त कारण है कि सरकार-जनता की राय द्वारा समर्थित होकर कंपनियों को नयी तकनीकी के प्रयोग के लिए बाध्य कर सकती है (जो कि महँगी और समय लेने वाली, दोनों होगी)। लेकिन कंपनी का पर्यावरण अनुपालन बजट तंग है। इस नयी तकनीक को स्थापित करने की मांग से ज्योति के विभाग का खर्च बजट से ऊपर निकल जायेगा और इसके चलते कंपनी के इस वर्ष लाभ दिखाने की क्षमता पर खतरा उत्पन्न हो सकता है। कुछ वैकल्पिक सुझाव दिये गये हैं। विकल्पों में से प्रत्येक के गुणों और दोषों का मूल्यांकन करें:

1. ज्योति को अपनी कंपनी के वित्तीय प्रदर्शन और मुनाफे पर ध्यान केन्द्रित करना चाहिए और पर्यावरण के मुद्दे को भूल जाना चाहिए, क्योंकि अनुपालन बजट पहले से ही तंग है।
  2. चूंकि कंपनी के उत्सर्जन का स्तर कानूनी सीमा के भीतर हैं। अतः सर्वप्रथम ज्योति को नए सरकारी नियमों के बनने का इंतजार करना चाहिए और उसके बाद ही कोई कार्रवाई करने के बारे में सोचना चाहिए।
  3. ज्योति को त्वरित रूप से इन मामले के बारे में उच्च प्रबंधन को अवगत करना चाहिए और सुनिश्चित करना चाहिए कि उचित कदम उठाये जाएँ, किन्तु अभी भी कंपनी के मुनाफे को सर्वोच्च प्राथमिकता देनी चाहिए।
- इसके साथ ही यह भी इंगित करें कि (सिर्फ ऊपर दिये गए विकल्पों तक सीमित न रहते हुए) आपकी क्या सलाह है, उचित तर्क भी प्रस्तुत करें।

Ans →

The fact of situation is that the emission levels are although within legal limits, Jyoti has knowledge that they have potential negative consequences.

The stakeholders in this situation include Jyoti, environment and the company.

Now evaluating the given options.

① To focus only on financial performance and profits without paying attention to environmental issue will not be good in the long term for following reasons -

- a) It ~~not~~ is hiding the information so against the value of truth.
- b) In future this may lead to higher costs.
- c) Also protection of environment is given as one of the fundamental duties in the constitution and also in directive principles.

② To wait for government regulations as current emissions are within limits is legally right but not ethically. It is also against value of ~~for~~ wisdom.  
She has knowledge she needs to



act. Also this will have higher financial implications in the future so not right from the utilitarian point of view also.

3) To report matter to higher management and giving utmost importance to profits - This approach is right as she is taking care of values of truth and virtue of wisdom. However Tyoti should bring this thing in notice of the management that profit and financial health itself will suffer if proper measures are not taken. Both the things are related.

Considering all the options, I will follow on the lines of option 3 by informing higher management proactively. However I will convince them about relation between taking care of environmental concern and profit.



16. Ronak has heard from his manager that their organization will be downsizing; it could be as little as 5 percent or as much as 30 percent. However, the supervisor told Ronak that "we're all under strict orders to keep it quiet" so that the agency's best employees will not seek other jobs. Mohan (one of the finest professionals in Ronak's unit), upon hearing the downsizing rumors, told Ronak that he was sure that he could get another job at a new business if a reduction in force occurred. However, openings at the new business will close soon. Mohan asked Ronak, "Will there be layoffs?" and "Should I get another job now?"
- (a) What are the options available to Ronak?
- (b) Evaluate each of these options and highlight which option you would have preferred, giving reasons for the same.

20

रोनक ने अपने मैनेजर से सुना है कि उसकी कंपनी में पदों की संख्या घटाई जाएगी; यह कम से कम 5 प्रतिशत से लेकर अधिकतम 30 प्रतिशत तक हो सकती है। हालांकि निरीक्षक ने रोनक को बताया है कि "हमें इसे गुप्त रखने के सख्त आदेश हैं" जिससे कंपनी के सबसे अच्छे कर्मचारी कहीं ओर नौकरियों की तलाश न करें।

मोहन (रोनक की इकाई का एक अच्छा कर्मचारी) ने पदों की संख्या में कटौती की इन अफवाहों को सुनकर रोनक से बताया कि उसे यकीन है कि यदि पदों की संख्या में कटौती की जाती है, तो उसे एक नए व्यवसाय/व्यापार में नौकरी मिल सकती है। हालांकि उस नए व्यवसाय/व्यापार में भर्तियाँ जल्द ही समाप्त हो जायेंगी। मोहन ने रोनक से पूछा कि "क्या छटनी होगी?" और "क्या अब मुझे नयी नौकरी ढूँढ लेनी चाहिए?"

a. रोनक के पास में विकल्प उपलब्ध हैं?

b. उन सभी विकल्पों का मूल्यांकन कीजिए और उस विकल्प को उचित तर्कों के माध्यम से उल्लिखित कीजिए जिसे आपने चुना है।

Ans→

The situation presents a moral dilemma for Ronak. On one hand he has to maintain confidential keep the news confidential and he also has to make sure that he ~~keeps~~ keeps trust of his employee. He also has to keep mohan in the organisation.



Various alternatives and their analysis is as follows -

- ① Telling Mohan that there will no lay offs will be against truth. In the long term it will lead to loss of confidence. Also in case Mohan is laid off, there will be more ~~is~~ consequence. This is not right from deontological or utilitarian or virtue ethics point.
- ② Telling Mohan that there may be lay offs → In such case Mohan will follow truth. However he will breach the secrecy entrusted by the supervisors. In such case Mohan may leave the organisation also. As is given that Mohan is one of the finest professionals

this will be loss of organisation.

3) Consulting the situation with  
Supervises and then telling

Mohan → In this case Ronak  
should consult the supervises  
about the given situation.

He should tell about professional  
competence of Mohan. After

convincing ~~Mohan~~ the supervises,

Mohan could be told that  
though there would be lay off.

his performance will be considered  
during the lay off process.

In this way Ronak will  
follow the truth as well as  
he will maintain the trust  
of the employee Mohan. After

this mohan will be less  
inclined to leave the  
organisation. For this purpose,  
if supervisor permits, he may  
be specifically told that he  
will not be laid off.



17. Mr. Sinha assigns a research problem in a high school calculus class. The problem is quite difficult and will require collaborative time and effort of a team. Mr. Sinha divides the class into groups of four students, gives them instructions, and tells them when the problem will be due.

Pradeep's group has an initial meeting and decides to divide up the work and then collaborate the information. Veena, one of Pradeep's group members, offers to write a particular section of the paper based on some great information she found on the Internet. The other members of the group, including Pradeep, divide the remaining work and proceed with their respective research.

One week before the project is due, Pradeep finds out that Veena has chosen to "copy and paste" most of her paper from the Internet source. Pradeep picks up on Veena's plagiarism and knows it is wrong, but he needs an "A" on this research problem in order to pass Calculus. Pradeep confronts Veena and asks her to redo her paper without plagiarizing, but Veena claims she is too busy with her other class work. She assures Pradeep that Mr. Sinha will never discover the plagiarism, and that if he does, she will take complete blame for it.

Pradeep finds himself in an extremely uncomfortable position. He feels partly responsible for the plagiarism because he is a part of the same group and he knows about it as well.

The following are some suggested options. Please evaluate the merits and demerits of each of the options:

1. Pradeep should forget about plagiarism as it is a common practice and ultimately he is not the one who did it.
2. Pradeep should highlight the issue to the whole group and then decide after taking everybody's advice.
3. Pradeep should talk directly to Mr. Sinha and leave it to him to take the right course of action.
4. Pradeep should himself redo the work of Veena and then submit the paper.

Also indicate (without necessarily restricting to the above options), what would you advise, giving proper reasons. 20

श्रीमान सिन्हा ने हाई स्कूल के अवकल गणित (calculus) की कक्षा को एक शोध का सवाल हल करने को दिया। सवाल अत्यंत ही कठिन है और जिसके एक समूह के सहयोगात्मक प्रयास और समय की आवश्यकता होगी। श्रीमान सिन्हा कक्षा को चार-चार छात्रों के समूह में बांटते हैं, उन्हें निर्देश देते हैं और उन्हें बताते हैं कि सवाल का जवाब कब तक चाहिए।

प्रदीप के समूह की एक प्रारंभिक बैठक हुई और कार्य को विभाजित कर, सूचनाओं को संकलित करने का निर्णय लिया गया। प्रदीप के समूह की एक सदस्या वीणा, इंटरनेट पर प्राप्त एक महत्वपूर्ण जानकारी के आधार पर शोध-पत्र के एक हिस्से को लिखने का



सुझाव देती है। प्रदीप सहित समूह के अन्य सदस्य शेष काम को विभाजित करते हैं और अपने संबंधित अनुसंधान के साथ आगे बढ़ते हैं।

प्रोजेक्ट जमा करने से एक सप्ताह पूर्व प्रदीप को पता चलता है कि वीणा ने शोध पत्र का अधिकांश भाग इंटरनेट से "कॉपी और पेस्ट" किया है। प्रदीप को वीणा की इस साहित्यिक चोरी का पता चल गया है और वह जानता है कि यह गलत है, लेकिन उसे इस शोध पत्र के माध्यम से कैलकुलस में उत्तीर्ण होने हेतु "A" श्रेणी चाहिए। प्रदीप वीणा का विरोध करता है और वह उससे इस शोध-पत्र को पुनः चोरी किये पूर्ण करने के लिए कहता है, लेकिन वीणा कहती है कि वह कक्षा के और दूसरे कार्यों में अत्यधिक व्यस्त है। वह प्रदीप को भरोसा दिलाती है कि सिन्हा जी इस साहित्यिक चोरी को कभी भी पकड़ नहीं पाएंगे और यदि पकड़ भी लिया तो इसकी सम्पूर्ण जिम्मेदारी वह स्वयं ले लेगी।

प्रदीप अपने आप को अत्यधिक असहज स्थिति में पाता है। वह इस साहित्यिक चोरी में अपने आप को भी जिम्मेदार मानता है, क्योंकि वह भी इस समूह का एक सदस्य है और इस चोरी के विषय में पता भी है।

कुछ वैकल्पिक सुझाव नीचे दिये गये हैं। कृपया प्रत्येक विकल्प के गुणों और दोषों का मूल्यांकन करें:

1. प्रदीप को इस साहित्यिक चोरी के विषय में भूल जाना चाहिए क्योंकि आजकल यह सामान्य बात और आखिरकार उसने यह चोरी नहीं की है।
2. प्रदीप को इस समस्या के बारे में पूरे समूह को अवगत करा देना चाहिए और फिर सभी की सलाह से निर्णय लेना चाहिए।
3. प्रदीप को सीधे सिन्हा जी से बात करनी चाहिए और आगे की उचित कार्यवाही उन पर छोड़ देनी चाहिए।
4. प्रदीप को वीणा के इस कार्य को स्वयं पुनः करना चाहिए और फिर शोध पत्र जमा करना चाहिए। इसके साथ ही यह भी इंगित करें कि (सिर्फ ऊपर दिये गए विकल्पों तक सीमित न रहते हुए) आपकी क्या सलाह है, उचित तर्क भी प्रस्तुत करें।

Ans

*The merits and demerits of various options are*

① *Forgetting about plagiarism as it is common practice and also he is not the doer would not be right course of action. As*

Pradeep has knowledge about this, not taking care of the problem would be cheating, hiding the facts which is against truth. Also in future it may have adverse consequences for other two teammates also who are completely ignorant about it.

2) Discussing with everybody and then deciding is a good option as Pradeep is not keeping his group members in dark. However in the discussion, he should voice his opinion to take care of plagiarism. They must also tell Veena that not doing her work properly is



breach of promise and promise keeping has been considered one of most desired virtues.

3) Tell Mr. Sinha directly and leave him to take action

This approach in one way is good. As it is about commit accepting the mistake and accepting punishment for it. However the better approach would be rectification of mistake.

4) Doing all the work by himself would not be good approach, as it gives wrong signal to Veena that she can evade responsibility without any consequences. It is also

against principle of justice.

In this light, I will  
first discuss with group  
members and ask Veena to  
redo the work. All group  
members can provide help to  
her. However if she refuses  
to do so, I will try to  
redo the work with the help  
of teammates as much as  
possible. Also I will bring the  
issue to notice of Mr. Sirha.



18. A terrorist group states that it has concealed a nuclear bomb in Delhi. The authorities have captured the leader of the group. He says that he knows the location of the bomb. He refuses to reveal the location. Torture is guaranteed to produce the information needed to ensure the diffusal of the bomb.

(a) Is it ethically acceptable for the authorities to have him tortured to find out where the bomb is and thus save thousands of lives?

(b) Suppose instead of catching the leader, the authorities have captured his 16 year old daughter. She is refusing to cooperate with the authorities. In your opinion is it morally justified to have her tortured to acquire necessary information and save thousands of lives?

15

एक आतंकवादी संगठन का कहना है कि उन्होंने दिल्ली में परमाणु बम छुपाया है। प्राधिकारियों ने उस संगठन के नेता को पकड़ लिया वह कहता है कि उसे बम की अवस्थिति मालूम है। उसने बम की अवस्थिति बताने से इंकार कर दिया है। बम को निष्क्रिय करने हेतु आवश्यक सूचना प्राप्ति के लिए उसे प्रताड़ित किया जाना आवश्यक है।

a. क्या प्राधिकारियों के लिए नैतिकता की दृष्टि से यह स्वीकार्य है कि उससे प्रताड़ित किया जाये और बम का पता लगाया जाये जिससे हजारों जाने बचायी जा सकें?

b. यदि मान लिया जाये कि उस नेता को पकड़ने की बजाय, अधिकारियों ने उसकी 16 वर्ष की बेटी को पकड़ लिया होता और वह प्राधिकारियों के साथ सहयोग करने से मना कर रही होती।

Ans →

(a) From deontological perspective, torturing him would not be ethical. Because this way we are using a human being as a mean.

However from ~~de~~ utilitarian perspective, this will lead to higher happiness/benefit as



large number of lives would be saved.

Also gandhian ethics talk of hating the crime not the criminal. They talk about the change of heart of criminals.

Thus firstly non violent means can be used to find the information. If that is not possible, for larger public good it is ethical to torture.

b) If the leader's 16 years old daughter is caught. In this light the following things are important.

i) she may not have any information at all.

ii) she is a minor so should be provided protection.

In such case there is need to use delicate balancing. ~~She is not~~ First of all it needs to be found out whether she has any knowledge or not. For this ~~must~~ she has to be persuaded to cooperate with the police. ~~Also~~ Also it must be made sure that a lady officer is present.

Here it is not ethical to torture her even from utilitarian perspective as there is no certainty of the public good.



19. You are in a supermarket with your younger brother. Your brother draws your attention to a young child stealing food packets from the counter. He looks needy and he is taking advantage of the crowded store which the owner fails to manage in peak hours. The owner has a reputation of being a greedy and mean person.

What will you do and why?

10

आप अपने छोटे भाई के साथ एक सुपरमार्केट में हैं। आपका भाई, काउंटर से भोजन के पैकेट चोरी करते हुए एक बच्चे की तरफ आपका आकर्षित करता है। वह जरूरतमंद लग रहा है और वह दुकान में भीड़ का लाभ ले रहा है, जिसे दुकान का मालिक व्यस्ततम समय में संभाल पाने में असमर्थ है। मालिक एक लालची और मतलबी व्यक्ति के रूप में जाना जाता है।

आप क्या करेंगे और क्यों करेंगे?

Ans -

If we see the child trying to steal food packets. There may be following options possible.

① Doing nothing → This approach will not be right. Firstly it will give wrong signal to child that it is ok to steal. Stealing has been considered vice by Jain, Buddhist and other religious ethics. Also this way, I am not following my duty.

(2) Bringing shop owner's attention to him → As the shop keeper is mean and greedy, he may hurt the child. In this way ~~we~~<sup>I</sup> shall be doing my duty however Gandhian ethics talk about hating the sin not sinner. Also the child looks needy, so this approach is not best.

3) I will confront the child and will persuade him against the stealing. I will also try to find out if he is ~~orphan~~ orphan or street children or separated from the parents. In such case I will try to help him.





20. During your election duty you caught hold of a vehicle full of cash. On inquiry, it was revealed to you that the vehicle belongs to a very popular politician of the region and even the exit polls are predicting his victory. The politician calls you up to release the vehicle. You try to approach your senior to seek advice but can't reach him.

(a) What are the options available to you?

(b) What course of action will you take?

15

अपनी चुनाव ड्यूटी के दौरान आपने नकदी से भरा एक वाहन पकड़ लिया। जाँच करने पर आप को पता चला कि वाहन क्षेत्र के एक बहुत लोकप्रिय राजनेता का है और यहाँ तक कि एग्जिट पोल उसकी जीत की भविष्यवाणी कर रहे हैं। राजनेता वाहन छोड़ने के लिए आप पर दबाव बना रहे हैं। सलाह लेने के लिए आपने अपने वरिष्ठ अधिकारी से संपर्क करने की कोशिश की, किन्तु सफल नहीं हो सके।

a. आप के पास उपलब्ध विकल्प क्या है?

b. आप क्या कार्यवाही करेंगे?

Ans →

Here the ethical dilemma is between following the duty and trying to minimise self interest by keeping good relations with the politician.

The various options available are-

① Doing nothing and releasing the vehicle → It will be against following the duty. It also is an indication of lack of



moral courage. This will impact  
have impact on the fast elections  
also. Same money may be used  
for buying voters and muscle power.  
It will also give impression to  
the politician that he can  
go unpunished.

② ~~Not~~ Other option is to take  
proper action. Informing the  
tax authorities and also higher  
election authorities regarding  
the same should be done.

For this purpose, I will also  
keep <sup>tab of</sup> follow up action so that  
justice should be served.

However there could be effort  
on the part of politicians and  
their supporters to forcefully

take the truck. I would alert the security officer incharge and will make sure proper security is provided.

Thus I will take proper action according to legal and constitutional provisions to ensure fair elections.



