



VISION IAS

www.visionias.in

GENERAL STUDIES (TEST CODE : 873)

Name of Candidate	ARCHANA P.P		
Medium Eng / Hindi	ENGLISH	Registration Number	90668
Center	(ONLINE) DISTANT	Date	13/09/2017

INDEX TABLE

Q. No.	Maximum Marks	Marks Obtained
1(a)	10	
1(b)	10	
2(a)	10	
2(b)	10	
3(a)	10	
3(b)	10	
4(a)	10	
4(b)	10	
5	10	
6	10	
7	10	
8	10	
9	20	
10	20	
11	20	
12	20	
13	25	
14	25	

Total Marks Obtained:

Remarks:

INSTRUCTIONS

- Do furnish the appropriate details in the answer sheet (viz. Name, Registration Number and Test Code).
उत्तर पुस्तिका में सूचनाएं भरना आवश्यक है (नाम, प्रश्न-पत्र कोड, विद्यार्थी क्रमांक आदि)।
- There are FOURTEEN questions printed in ENGLISH & HINDI
इसमें चौदह प्रश्न हैं अंग्रेजी और हिन्दी में छपे हैं।
- All questions are compulsory.
सभी प्रश्न अनिवार्य हैं।
- The number of marks carried by a question/part is indicated against it.
प्रत्येक प्रश्न भाग के अंक उसके सामने दिए गए हैं।
- Answers must be written in the medium authorized in the Admission Certificate, which must be stated clearly on the cover of this Question-Cum-Answer (QCA) Booklet in the space provided. No marks will be given for answers written in medium other than the authorized one.
प्रश्नों के उत्तर उसी माध्यम में लिखे जाने चाहिए जिसका उल्लेख आपके प्रवेश पत्र में किया गया है और उस माध्यम का स्पष्ट उल्लेख प्रश्न-सह-उत्तर (क्यूसीए) पुस्तिका के मुख्य पृष्ठ पर अंकित निर्दिष्ट स्थान पर किया जाना चाहिए। उल्लिखित माध्यम के अतिरिक्त अन्य किसी माध्यम में लिखे गए उत्तर पर कोई अंक नहीं मिलेगा।
- Word limit in questions, if specified, should be adhered to.
प्रश्नों में शब्द सीमा, जहाँ निर्दिष्ट है, का अनुसरण किया जाना चाहिए।
- Any page or portion of the page left blank in the Question-Cum-Answer Booklet must be clearly struck off.
उत्तर पुस्तिका में खाली छोड़ा हुआ पृष्ठ या उसके अंश को स्पष्ट रूप से काटा जाना चाहिए।

75, 3rd Floor, Old Rajinder Nagar Market, Near Axis Bank, New Delhi – 110060

103, 1st Floor, B/1-2, Ansal Building, Behind UCO Bank, Dr. Mukherjee Nagar, Delhi – 110009

Answer the following questions in not more than 150 words each:

1. (a) The more remotely power is exercised from the people, the greater is the distance between authority and accountability. Discuss. 10

(a) जितना लोगों से सत्ता का प्रयोग दूर होगा, उतना ही अधिक प्राधिकारी और जवाबदेही के बीच अंतर होगा। चर्चा कीजिए।

More is the centralisation
of power, farther is the power
exercise from accountability.

Centralisation pushes the exercise
of power away from the people
on whom it is exercised. It
reduces access of people towards
the authority. It reduces the
instances where people can
question the authority and demand
answers. Enforcing answerability

becomes a challenge in such a case.

In contrast, 'greater decentralisation reduces distance between power centre and people.

This not only makes access to authority easier, but also makes people empowered about their right to seek answers.

Enforcing accountability in grass roots authority is easier and simpler than an authority that sit far from people.

1. (b) "If you want others to be happy, practice compassion. If you want to be happy, practice compassion". In what ways can a compassionate public official be more useful for realizing public service goals? 10

(b) "यदि आप दूसरों को प्रसन्न रखना चाहते हैं, तो करुणावान बनें। यदि आप प्रसन्न रहना चाहते हैं तो करुणा अपनाएं।" किस प्रकार से एक करुणावान लोक सेवक सार्वजनिक सेवा के लक्ष्यों को साकार करने के लिए अधिक उपयोगी हो सकता है?

Caring for the fellow being or compassion has remained one of the cardinal human value from advent of life to new management practices of public Service.

Public service goals need a public servant to be responsive and to needs of public.

For this one needs to understand needs of public — which needs an element of compassion

Compassion is essential to initiate
a For one to initiate new
services to benefit of public,
element of compassion is essential.

It is compassion that guided a
public servant in Kerala to
start an initiative to serve food
to destitute through voluntary
funding by other citizens.

Lack of compassion results
in lack of emotional intelligence.
One ends up in a rulebook framework
where rules are followed in
their text and not context.

Lack of compassion makes a public
official useless in achieving larger
public goals.

2. (a) The recent decision by the government to ban use of red beacons is only a symbolic gesture and a lot more needs to be done to end the VIP culture in India. Critically discuss.

10

(a) लाल बत्ती के प्रयोग पर प्रतिबन्ध सम्बन्धी सरकार का तालिया निर्णय केवल एक प्रतीकात्मक संकेत हैं और भारत में वीआईपी संस्कृति समाप्त करने के लिए बहुत कुछ किए जाने की आवश्यकता है। आलोचनात्मक रूप से चर्चा कीजिए।

Culture of differentiating people
in public sphere based on their
relative importance have been a
culture that is ^{prevalent} ~~prevails~~ in India.
since long.

In this context, the recent ban of use of red beacons was taken up by government to ~~put~~ put an end to this VIP culture.

However, rules and laws are ^{easier} ~~better~~ legislated or ordered than enforced.

This is a culture that has lured people into being politicians or public service officials since long.

An end to this culture will need time as these change in values take time. ~~to~~ Society has to imbibe this value change.

VIP culture is not manifested only through the beaoned cars but in all public places- like airports, railways and even in hospitality.

So ban on red beacons is to be considered only as a beginning and it is a beginning in right direction.

2. (b) To what extent can financial incentives help shape attitude towards social issues? Discuss with relevant examples. 10

(b) किस हद तक आर्थिक प्रोत्साहन सामाजिक मुद्दों के प्रति अभिवृत्ति को आकार देने में सहायता कर सकते हैं? प्रासंगिक उदाहरणों सहित चर्चा कीजिए।

Government has taken various measures to persuade people to bring the attention of people towards larger social issues plaguing the country.

In order to persuade people, to change attitudes, government has also introduced financial incentives.

For example, family planning in India to control the bulging population was based on financial

incentives. However, it was found that couples went up for planning incentives only after they have number of children that they aspire.

Change in attitude, needs change in values. There is a cultural lag involved in value changes as attitudes are developed after long period of socialisation.

So focussing just on financial incentives cannot bring about results. There must also be persuasion from other ends—like awareness. For instance, family planning began gaining momentum as educational standards rose along with financial incentives.

3. (a) At times, moral behaviour can be constrained by the complexity of legal system. Explain. In this context, explain the purpose of legal protection for good samaritans in the case of road accidents. 10

(a) कई बार, नैतिक व्यवहार कानूनी प्रणाली की जटिलता के चलते निरुद्ध हो सकता है। व्याख्या कीजिये। इस संदर्भ में, सड़क दुर्घटनाओं के मामलों में संकट के समय सहायता देने वाले अच्छे व्यक्तियों (good samaritans) के लिए कानूनी संरक्षण के उद्देश्य को समझाएं।

Every man is inherently moral.
Conscience offers ethical guidelines
for our action, but at times legal
issues put constraints on exercise
of such actions.

For instance people usually
do not ~~want~~ try to interfere
in any conflicts they witness in
public places in fear of being
caught as a perpetrator of crime
in our legal system.

Legal system is not accessible

or understandable to public
making them inaccessible to public.

In this context there is
the need to protect good samaritans
in case of road accidents.

One hour after an accident
is considered as golden hour to
protect the victim of accident.

However in most cases, people do
not feet come up in favour
help of the victims is fear of

being caught up in the complex
legal setup. The good samaritans
are often harassed and forced to
produce witness — which explains
need for a legal protection to men
of good conscience.

3. (b) Examine the different ethical issues involved in the use of public shaming as a punitive measure. Do you think this is an appropriate measure to address the problem of rising crime rates. 10

(b) दंडात्मक उपाय के रूप में सार्वजनिक रूप से लज्जित करने (public shaming) जैसे उपायों में जुड़े विभिन्न नैतिक मुद्दों का परीक्षण कीजिए। क्या आप मानते हैं कि बढ़ते अपराध दर की समस्या हल करने के लिए यह उपयुक्त उपाय है।

'Name and shame' is used as a policy to punish the ones who violate norms and also a preventive measure to those vulnerable to violating norms.

However ethical issues are involved in public shaming as punitive measure -

(1) An act must attract only is. appropriate consequence. There is a penal provision for a crime that must be invoked rather than a disproportionate consequence.

(2) Every one has moral right to

privacy which is hampered.
(3) Basic human right to dignity is violated which is ethically unacceptable.

(4) There is no assurance that public sharing cause deterrence.

(5) This may further create an. perpetuate the image of person as a criminal pushing them further to troubled circumstances.

A study in US had found that first time criminals were further instigated to violence due to such public image - they are not allowed to leave the past and correct their mistake. ^{This} ~~which~~ makes public sharing an inappropriate measure to arrest rising crime rates.

4. (a) Why did Gunnar Myrdal use the term 'soft state' in the context of South Asia? Do you think such a characterisation is still relevant in the case of India today? 10

(a) गुन्नार मिर्दल ने दक्षिण एशिया के संदर्भ में 'मृदु राज्य' का प्रयोग क्यों किया है ? क्या आप मानते हैं कि इस प्रकार का विशेषीकरण आज के भारत के संदर्भ में भी प्रासंगिक है?

Gunnar Myrdal in his 'Asian
drama' has used soft state in
context of south Asia.

He considered that the liberal
democracy there created an image
of soft state in front of the
world.

The moral ideals of non-violence,
peace in India are considered
as being characteristic of state
that cannot be hard on its
stand. For instance, the Kandahar

flight hijacking incident and release of Mashood Azhar was considered a soft stance of India.

However after this incident India has sent out message to the world that it would not take such moral stands in future.

Anything contrary to the law, international norms would not be tolerated.

Recent Doklam standoff points to this stand as India stood strong with great moral conviction of not giving up its sovereign rights for false claims.

4. (b) Intolerance can be linked both to prejudices and value judgments. Elaborate with relevant examples. Also discuss how intolerance can be countered in a multicultural society like India. 10

- (b) असहिष्णुता को पूर्वाग्रह और मूल्यानुमानों (value judgments) दोनों से जोड़ा जा सकता है। प्रासंगिक उदाहरणों के साथ सविस्तार वर्णन कीजिए। साथ ही चर्चा कीजिए कि भारत जैसे बहुसांस्कृतिक समाज में असहिष्णुता का प्रतिकार कैसे किया जा सकता है।

The ability of man to appreciate things and be tolerant to a different viewpoint face constraints because of prejudices and value judgements.

We have preconceived notions about some things or people that we don't look at ~~they~~ them objectively. This result in inability to accept the reality.

For instance - some people are so prejudiced with man-woman relationships as immoral that they ended up ^{harming} a brother and sister going ^{out} together. ~~in~~

Similarly value judgements - judging somebody's values as of lesser or higher standard poses another constraint. For instance, a man who is not well dressed is always mostly suspected to be a thief or beggar and people end up unable to tolerate presence of such people.

In a multicultural society like India, to ensure that social order is maintained there must be better understanding of people around them. Differences need to be accepted only when presence of difference is accepted. Education should be a prime tool to ensure that diversity of India and views are understood.

5. Social attitude towards corruption has become more forgiving with time leading to a view of illegal gains and misappropriation of public assets as a "rightful" individual prerogative. Analyse in the context of India. 10

समय के साथ भ्रष्टाचार के प्रति सामाजिक दृष्टिकोण अधिक क्षम्य बन गया है जिससे "उचित" व्यक्तिगत विशिष्टाधिकार के रूप में गैर-कानूनी लाभों और सार्वजनिक परिसंपत्तियों के दुरुविनियोग का मार्ग प्रशस्त हुआ है। भारत के संदर्भ में विश्लेषण कीजिए।

Corruption is a malice which being tolerated grew to unbound levels in Indian system.

In recent times with more number of large scale scams being unearthed, petty corrupt cases are considered with less contempt than past. Social attitude has become more forgiving as petty corruption has more become like a norm being practiced over time

~~Corr~~ Bribery and has become
collusive rather than coercive over
years. It is considered as the
However, today in India
there right of an officer who has
come to that position after much
bribery and hardwork.

However, with rise of
digital technologies, RTI, Lokpal
movement, even this perception is
changing. Corruption instances come
out more often in the media.
People are gaining moral courage
to fight corruption although only
at budding state.

6. What are the factors which draw people to public service? Suggest measures to keep public servants motivated. 10

लोगों को लोक सेवा की ओर आकर्षित करने वाले कारक क्या हैं? लोक सेवकों को प्रेरित रखने के उपाय सुझाए।

Public service continues to draw more and more youth to its folds today.

Factors:

- (1) Public service is felt to add better meaning to life than private as there is most times direct interaction with society.
- (2) Some may feel reciprocal obligation to society that has built them as a person.
- (3) Public services give them more opportunity to take up activities that affect a larger audience.
- (4) Being a moral agent and.

witnessing the sufferings of the society and social evils, there is a moral push to participate in overcoming these challenges.

However, there is a need also to ensure that public servants remain committed even after entering the services.

(1) Incentives for better performance.

Best outcomes of efforts need to be part of annual confidential report.

(2) Shielding from any political influence of upright officers.

(3) Laws should protect honest officers.

(4) Continuous training and updation

Recent removal of inefficient officers from IAS, IPS are also ways taken up by government to deter inefficiency.

7. Corporate Governance provides a framework that defines the rights, roles and responsibilities of various groups within an organization. (a) Elaborate the need to incorporate the principles of Corporate Governance to enhance the effectiveness of the public sector enterprises. (b) Identify the challenges specific to the public sector when it comes to the application of good practices of corporate governance. 10

कॉर्पोरेट गवर्नेंस वह ढांचा प्रदान करता है जो संगठन के भीतर विभिन्न समूहों की भूमिकाएं, अधिकार और उत्तरदायित्व परिभाषित करता है। (a) सार्वजनिक क्षेत्र के उद्यमों की प्रभावशीलता बढ़ाने के लिए कॉर्पोरेट गवर्नेंस के सिद्धांतों को समाविष्ट करने की आवश्यकता का मविस्तार वर्णन कीजिए। (b) जब कॉर्पोरेट गवर्नेंस की अच्छी पद्धतियों के अनुप्रयोग की बात आती है तो सार्वजनिक क्षेत्र के लिए विशिष्ट चुनौतियों की पहचान कीजिए।

(a) The private sector is believed to be more efficient in service delivery compared to the public sector enterprises among larger public.

Having been 'customers of private services, the citizen customers now demand equally efficient services from public enterprises also.

In the liberalised economy driven by market principles, it is essential to follow corporate governance standards so that public services

remain competent with private standards in domestic and international market

Corporate governance prescribes a well clear set of guidelines which prevent nepotism and allegations of political influence in PSEs. This ensures accountability, transparency and autonomy.

(b) Challenges:

- ① PSEs inherit rigid bureaucratic setup of the government causing delays and red-tapism
- ② Government offices being hierarchial may find hard to adopt a more consensus oriented attitude needed in corporate.
- ③ Political class influence may hamper progress.
- ④ Appointments ~~will~~ need to be scrutinised more - may hamper innovation. [eg- (A6)]

8. Emotions, earlier considered as an irrational factor in decision-making, are now recognised as a critical factor of judgment. In this regard, answer the following questions: (a) How can Emotional Intelligence help in coping with the intense pressure and occupational stress faced by police officers and armed forces in discharge of their duties? (b) What are the some of the concerns in incorporating and assessment of emotional intelligence skills in public service? 10

भावनाओं को, जिन्हें निर्णय लेने में पहले एक अतार्किक कारक माना जाता था, अब निर्णय का महत्वपूर्ण कारक माना जाता है। इस संबंध में, निम्नलिखित प्रश्नों का उत्तर दीजिए:

- (a) अपने कर्तव्यों का निर्वहन में पुलिस कर्मियों और सशस्त्र बलों द्वारा सामना किए जाने वाले तीव्र दबाव और कार्य सम्बन्धी तनाव (occupational stress) का मुकाबला करने में भावात्मक प्रज्ञता (Emotional Intelligence) किस प्रकार सहायता कर सकती है?
(b) लोक सेवा में भावात्मक प्रज्ञता कौशल को समाविष्ट करने और आंकलन सम्बन्धी कुछ चिन्ताएं क्या हैं?

(a) Emotional intelligence is a critical factor today in public services.

This is especially so in case of security providers who face immense pressure in their duty.

Police and armed forces work in circumstances of conflict. This needs them to manage emotions of anger and aggression to ensure proper handling of law and order situation. It helps in not being merely reactive. Also 'having a good EI' would

help them being better aware of their own mental state so that they can ensure actions are not biased towards anyone, even criminals.

EI also help them have better connection within the team which is important as security operations are team efforts.

(b) However, incorporating EI skills is a time taking exercise. It needs training which can produce results only if officials are willing for change. 'No change' - attitude of public servants may be cause of concern.

Also assessing EI skills are not easy as they are more qualitative ^{than} ~~than~~ quantitative. Outcomes can't be easily judged.

9. You, a manager in one of the top IT firms in the country, are tasked with hiring new recruits for an upcoming project. You find that the company has given tacit instructions of not hiring female candidates in view of the new maternity law passed by the Government. You find this highly objectionable and lodge a protest with people in the higher management but they are firm as they want to cut down all the unnecessary costs. Based on this information, answer the following questions:

- Identify the stakeholders and their interests in the situation.
- What are the dilemmas that a recruiting manager may face in such a scenario?
- What are the different options available to you? Which one will you pursue and why?

20

आप देश की एक शीर्ष आईटी कंपनी के प्रबंधक हैं। आपको आगामी परियोजना के लिए नई भर्तियां करने का उत्तरदायित्व सौंपा गया है। आप पाते हैं कि सरकार द्वारा पारित किए गए नवीन मातृत्व कानून के आलोक में कंपनी ने महिला अभ्यर्थियों की भर्ती न करने का अकथित निर्देश दिया गया है। आप इसे अत्यधिक आपत्तिजनक पाते हैं और प्रबंधन के उच्च अधिकारियों से विरोध जताते हैं, लेकिन वे दृढ़ हैं क्योंकि वे सभी अनावश्यक व्यय में कमी करना चाहते हैं।

इस जानकारी के आधार पर, निम्नलिखित प्रश्नों का उत्तर दीजिए:

- इस स्थिति में हितधारकों और उनके हितों की पहचान कीजिए।
- वे धर्मसंकट क्या हैं जिनका ऐसी परिस्थिति में भर्ती प्रबंधक द्वारा सामना किया जा सकता है?
- आपके पास उपलब्ध विभिन्न विकल्प क्या हैं? आप किसका अनुसरण करेंगे और क्यों?

(a) In the given case, various stakeholders are:

Myself, the manager - I do not want to be biased and wish to hire females also
Company - wants to reduce costs which they'll have to take up due to new law
Female applicants - Have the right to

equal representation based on merit.

Government - Enacted law to protect interest of women employee during maternity and not to put them at disadvantage.

Society at large - Wants equal rights to women. The society may protest if the matter becomes public.

(b) As ^{A Recruiting} ~~the~~ manager may face following dilemmas in the situation:

(1) Conscience vs Duty

While the order from company is to be followed based on professional ethics, the conscience of manager may not agree. This may create a moral anxiety. ~~His~~ ~~states~~ His/her integrity will be in question.

(2) Issue of Gender ethics.

As it may be A candidate may be capable in terms of merit and qualification, but manager may have to reject her just because of being female.

(3) Goal of the rule vs Consequence of rule

When the manager know that maternity benefit law is to protect female employee, the objective of law is killed by not selecting women employee at all.

(4) Profit motive vs justice

It would not be morally right to deny just rights to meritorious women.

candidates for profit. His/her duty
 as recruiting manager demands to
 recruit best talent.

(c) In the given scenario, various
 options available before me are:

[1] WHISTLE BLOW THE MATTER.

Merit

(1) This holds my integrity high as
 there is no conflict between
 conscience and action.

(2) Government will deal with matter
 effectively

Demerit

(1) May deprive me of the job.

(2)

[2] IGNORE THE CONSCIENCE AND.
FOLLOW ORDERS.

Merit: ① My job would be secure.
② Professional obligation to company is fulfilled.

Demerit ① It is wrong ethically considering larger society
② Conscience will prick me at all points.

[C] TRY to persuade the company.
higher officials of the profit that may accrue of being an ethically upright company by hiring women employees too. If not agreeing, I would deny to be part of recruitment.
This option will be chosen by

me as, thought the practise may still follow, there is a chance of company heeding to my suggestion.

Benefits of a larger public image may lure management to take a right decision.

10. There has been a perceptible rise in the cost of healthcare services provided by private hospitals. In absence of adequate and quality government hospitals, people are forced to opt for private hospitals, especially for life threatening diseases and injuries. You recently visit one of your friends admitted in a famous private hospital. You found out that the hospital is charging a huge amount of money, which seems to be unreasonable. You confront the staff and ask them to explain the rationale behind such high charges.

Their response is that the charges are fair for the kind of services they are providing.

- (a) What are the ethical issues involved in this situation?
- (b) Given how other professions price their services, discuss the feasibility of capping the amount of fees charged by doctors and private hospitals.
- (c) How can the provision of quality services and need for profit be reconciled with society's interests in this case? 20

निजी अस्पतालों द्वारा प्रदान की जाने वाली स्वास्थ्य सेवाओं की लागत में सुस्पष्ट वृद्धि हुई है। पर्याप्त और गुणवत्ता पूर्ण सरकारी अस्पतालों के अभाव में, लोग निजी अस्पतालों का विकल्प चुनने के लिए विवश हैं, विशेषकर जीवन के लिए खतरनाक बीमारियों और चोटों हेतु। आप हाल ही में एक प्रसिद्ध निजी अस्पताल में भर्ती अपने मित्र से मिलने जाते हैं। आपको पता चलता है कि अस्पताल बड़ी धनराशि वसूल रहा है जो आपको अनुचित या आवश्यकता से अधिक प्रतीत होता है। आप कर्मचारियों से बातचीत करते हैं और उनसे इस प्रकार के उच्च शुल्क के पीछे का तर्क समझाने के लिए कहते हैं।

उनकी प्रतिक्रिया यह है कि उनके द्वारा जिस प्रकार की सेवाएँ प्रदान की जाती हैं उसके लिए यह शुल्क उचित है।

- (a) इस स्थिति से जुड़े नैतिक मुद्दे क्या हैं?
- (b) यह देखते हुए कि अन्य व्यवसाय अपनी सेवाओं का मूल्य कैसे तय करते हैं, चिकित्सकों और निजी अस्पतालों द्वारा आरोपित शुल्क की राशि पर सीमा निर्धारित करने की व्यवहार्यता पर चर्चा कीजिए।
- (c) इस प्रकरण में गुणवत्ता परक सेवाओं के प्रबंध और लाभ की आवश्यकता का समाज के हितों के साथ सामंजस्य कैसे स्थापित किया जा सकता है?

(a) Ethical issues involved in given situation are:

(1) Unreasonable prices aiming profit

Just because there is not much competition in quality healthcare provisions, certain private hospitals monopolise the service delivery and charge exorbitant rates. There is no principle of professional ethics. Essential services like healthcare should involve social business principle.

(2) Inequality is perpetuated

As the poor cannot have access

to such expensive services, they are excluded. The vulnerables who are in need are excluded leading to inequity and partiality.

(3) Lack of compassion or empathy

among doctors and health care professionals in such hospitals.

Some others who really empathise may be pushed back - facing conflict of conscience vs profit.

(4) Government - lacking moral accountability as have the responsibility

to ensure essential services being a welfare state

(b) Given the lack of exorbitant and unreasonable pricing of health care services, there is a need to rationalise pricing of such services at institution level as well as individual doctor charge level.

However, as healthcare service quality is not generally quantifiable this may be a difficult exercise.

Nevertheless, government could conduct an outcome analysis for each institution and doctor for successes. Government could reimburse ~~the~~ and incentivise professionals who are ethically upright.

(c) In this case, there is a need to balance the profit motive of any enterprise with larger needs of society.

Society demands equitable and quality healthcare access that is affordable. This is lacking because of lack of government services and monopoly of certain privates.

Government expenditure on health should be increased.

Primary healthcare provider has to government. Insurance may be provided for poor to access private care also.

11. You are the District Magistrate in a district where a significant number of transgenders reside. While discrimination against the community is well known, commuters increasingly complain of harassment at their hands, especially at traffic junctions where transgenders are mostly involved in begging. This, at times, also leads to traffic management issues. You have received a number of complaints in this regard and have to act quickly to resolve it. However, a group of transgender associations argue that begging is their only source of livelihood.

Given the situation, answer the following questions:

(a) Describe the ethical issues involved in this case. Discuss the attitude of people towards transgenders in general and reasons for the same.

(b) What possible courses of action can be undertaken in such situations? Discuss their merits and demerits. 20

आप ऐसे जिले में जिला मजिस्ट्रेट हैं जहां ट्रांसजेंडर की बड़ी संख्या रहती है। यद्यपि इस समुदाय के विरुद्ध भेदभाव सुविदित है, तथापि यात्री उनके हाथों, विशेषकर यातायात जंक्शनों पर अधिकाधिक उत्पीड़न की शिकायत करते हैं, जहां ट्रांसजेंडर अधिकांशतः भीख मांगने में शामिल होते हैं। कभी-कभी, इससे यातायात प्रबंधन की समस्या भी पैदा होती है। इस संबंध में आपको कई शिकायतें मिली हैं और इसे हल करने के लिए शीघ्र कार्रवाई करनी है। हालांकि, ट्रांसजेंडर संघ के एक समूह का कहना है कि 'भीख मांगना उनकी आजीविका का एकमात्र स्रोत है।

इस स्थिति को देखते हुए, निम्नलिखित प्रश्नों का उत्तर दीजिए:

(a) इस प्रकरण से जुड़े नैतिक मुद्दों का वर्णन कीजिए। ट्रांसजेंडर लोगों के प्रति जनसामान्य के सामान्य दृष्टिकोण और उसके कारणों पर चर्चा कीजिए।

(b) ऐसी स्थिति में क्या संभव कार्रवाई की जा सकती है? उनके गुणों और अङ्गुणों पर चर्चा कीजिए।

The case involves a vulnerable section of population and props up certain ethical issues -

(1) Right to a dignified life
of Transgenders vs society's
attitude resulting in discrimination

Society at large treat
transgenders as inauspicious and
abnormal pushing them out of
any dignified livelihood opportunity

It is society that pushes them
to begging and same society
blame them for begging.

There is lack of empathy for
Vulnerables.

~~(2) Begging for livelihood vs~~

(2) Interest of vulnerable vs interest of larger society.

Permitting leading to the demands of transgenders to protect their only livelihood option puts the societal interest at stake. They may continue harassment and smooth operation of the district transport.

(3) Begging as a moral offence.

As one is demanding reward for no work of theirs. Wealth without work is moral sin.

Transgenders are pushed to commit such a sin

People in general has a negative attitude towards transgender

They are considered abnormal.

and inauspicious by some.

There is tendency to use 'transgender' for derogatory remarks in society.

Reasons for this is a lack of understanding of the community about such group. Transgender

Being transgender is considered a matter of choice when it is a natural or inherent. There needs to be empathy to

understand their position.

(c) Possible courses of action:

[1] Try to persuade or force them
to not continue practice.

MERIT

(1) Issue can
be solved
without any
violence.

DEMERIT

(1) Transgenders may
not agree to it.
(2) Public may not
be satisfied.

[2] Take action considering it as law
and order issue - Seek police
assistance.

MERIT

(1) Problem may
be solved
(2) Larger society
can be convinced.

DEMERIT

(1) Further the
prejudice about
transgenders.

[3] Try to rehabilitate transgenders
elsewhere and ^{initiate} create a public
Perception management programme.

12. Mr. X is the head of an NGO working in the field of environment conservation and protection. He is in dire need of funds for the NGO's operations and payments to his staff. He is approached by an official of a large infrastructure company, who is ready to provide the required funding for the NGO. But, in a quid pro quo, he asks Mr. X to raise objections over the bypassing of Environmental Impact Assessment (EIA) norms in an ongoing PPP project through his NGO. This project is being implemented by a rival infrastructure company. Mr. X knows that there have been instances of high level corruption in the process of granting EIA to mega projects and the information provided by the official seems to be authentic. Hence, he accepts the money and agrees to raise the objection.

(a) Considering the circumstances of the case, is Mr. X correct in accepting the money? Give appropriate reasons for your answer.

(b) If you were in place of Mr. X, what would have been your course of action? Give reasons for it. 20

श्री एक्स पर्यावरण संरक्षण और सुरक्षा के क्षेत्र में कार्यरत एक NGO (गैर सरकारी संगठन) के प्रमुख हैं। उन्हें NGO के संचालन और कर्मचारियों को भुगतान करने हेतु धन की अत्यन्त आवश्यकता है। एक बड़ी इंफ्रास्ट्रक्चर कंपनी का एक अधिकारी उनसे संपर्क करता है। कंपनी NGO के लिए आवश्यक फंड उपलब्ध कराने को तैयार है। लेकिन उसके बदले वह कंपनी यह चाहती है कि श्री एक्स अपने NGO के माध्यम से चल रही PPP परियोजना में पर्यावरण प्रभाव आकलन (EIA) मानदंडों की अवहेलना पर आपत्तियां उठाएं। यह परियोजना प्रतिद्वंद्वी इंफ्रास्ट्रक्चर कंपनी द्वारा कार्यान्वित की जा रही है। श्री एक्स को पता है कि बड़े प्रोजेक्ट्स के लिए EIA प्रदान करने की प्रक्रिया में उच्च स्तरीय भ्रष्टाचार के मामले सामने आए हैं और अधिकारियों द्वारा दी गई जानकारी प्रामाणिक प्रतीत होती है। इसलिए, वह धन स्वीकार कर लेते हैं और आपत्ति उठाने के लिए सहमत हो जाते हैं।

(a) प्रकरण की परिस्थितियों को ध्यान में रखते हुए, क्या श्री एक्स का धन स्वीकार करना सही है? अपने उत्तर के लिए उचित कारण दीजिए।

(b) यदि आप श्री एक्स के स्थान पर होते, तो आप क्या कदम उठाते? इसके कारण बताइए।

(a) No, Mr. X is not correct in accepting the money in the given case.

Mr. X may have accepted the money as the information is authentic and he is already aware of instances of corruption.

He may have ~~other~~ raised objections for violation of EIA norms had he known of the corruption violation even without the funds. He might have accepted the fund to carry out further operations so of

NGO and also fulfill the
obligations to staff.

However, any quid pro quo
basis action put the NGO in
a moral obligation towards the
large infrastructure company.

They may in future asks
for favours that may be
even not reasonable to
fail their rival companies.

The act of the Mr. X points
out a signal that he may

be amenable to corrupt activities
in lure of financial incentive.

This may tarnish the image of
NGo. The larger society may
even distrust the whole ~~envi~~
environment conservation initiatives.
as being used for bargaining and
blackmailing.

cb) If I were in place of Mr. X,
I would have proceeded with
raising objections to the PPP
project but would not accept the
funds for it. I would try

to convince my staff that
such act would ~~ris~~ raise
the moral standards of NGO.
This may even persuade more
funding to NGO through
right channels as NGO
would gain a morally status
of being ethically upright.
Risking the integrity and goal
of NGO is not an option
worth taking.

13. You are a civil servant posted in a state where elections were recently held. The newly elected Chief Minister had promised to ban alcohol in several of his election campaigns as well as his election manifesto, which was widely praised and supported by women of the state. Fulfilling his electoral promise, the Chief Minister has ordered a blanket ban on the sale of alcohol in the state. Following the ban, concerns have been raised about the feasibility of the ban and whether the government should interfere in what is considered by many to be a matter of personal choice.

(a) Who are the stakeholders in this case and how are they affected by the ban?

(b) Is blanket ban on alcohol a feasible action?

(c) Identify the issues that may arise while enforcing the ban and the steps you will take to handle them, as a civil servant.

25

आप एक ऐसे राज्य में सिविल सेवक के रूप में तैनात हैं जहां हाल ही में चुनाव हुए थे। नव निर्वाचित मुख्यमंत्री ने अपने कई चुनावी अभियानों के साथ-साथ चुनाव घोषणापत्र में शराब पर प्रतिबंध लगाने का वादा किया था, जिसकी राज्य की महिलाओं ने व्यापक रूप से प्रशंसा की थी और समर्थन दिया था। अपने चुनावी वादे को पूरा करते हुए, मुख्यमंत्री ने राज्य में शराब की विक्री पर पूर्ण प्रतिबन्ध का आदेश दिया है। प्रतिबंध के बाद, प्रतिबंध की व्यवहार्यता पर प्रश्न उठाए गए हैं और क्या सरकार द्वारा शराब पर प्रतिबन्ध जिसे कई लोगों द्वारा व्यक्तिगत पसंद का विषय बताया गया है, उस मुद्दे पर हस्तक्षेप करना चाहिए।

(a) इस मामले में हितधारक कौन हैं और प्रतिबंध से वे किस प्रकार प्रभावित हैं?

(b) क्या शराब पर पूर्ण प्रतिबन्ध एक व्यवहार्य कार्रवाई है?

(c) एक सिविल सेवक के रूप में इन प्रतिबंधों को लागू करते समय उत्पन्न होने वाली समस्याओं की पहचान करें और उनसे निपटने हेतु आप क्या कदम उठाएंगे।

(a) The case involves an enforced ban on sale of alcohol in state as a part of election promise.

Various stakeholders involved are:

- ① Government represented by chief minister - has to ensure that the ban is effective in curbing menace of alcoholism. ~~Avoid~~ Deal with challenges in implementation
- ② The people who voted in favour of expecting ban, including women.
They would have increased confidence in government.
- ③ The alcohol consumers
They would be critical of government for interfering in their personal choices
- ④ Alcohol sellers - may be deprived of their livelihood.
- ⑤ Enforcement authority - civil servants
may find it hard to implement the ban.

Police may have to deal with possible chances of illegal marketing. Law and order issues as new ban invite new violators.

(13)(b) - Blanket ban on alcohol may not be a feasible action given that in a liberal democracy like India people have fundamental right to choose what they consume.

(§ Government interference in personal choices may not be welcome even among ~~supporters~~ opponents of alcoholism. Any enforced choice would not last long.

There may be increased cases of illegal market propping up.

Livelihood security of large number of people may be at stake. State revenues may also be effected which may reduce states expenditure even on social services.

The alcohol lobby may take matter to judiciary leading to delays and litigations prolonging a decision.

Ban on intoxicants though a directly directive principle may not be enforceable in society as a blanket ban.

13 (c) Issues that may arise during ban-

(1) Rise of a black market for alcohols may pose law and order issue -

Smuggling

(2) The people who lost livelihood due to ban may join smuggling groups.

(3) There may be protests leading to potential violence in state.

(4) Possibility of increased number of violators ~~is~~ may put constraint on jail capacity.

(5) Chances of conflict between supporters and opposers of the ban.

Steps that can be taken to
tackle these issues.

- (1) Strict surveillance of goods moving in and out of the state.
- (2) Using local informers to gather intelligence and information.
- (3) At the same time, trying to garner public support through campaigns and classes.
- (4) Involving women in helping tackle these issues at grassroot level.
- (5) Opening up facilities for training the unemployed in new skills.
Helping them register and get employed via employment exchange.

14. Regulation and procedure of human clinical trials vary from nation to nation. Stem cell research, as an emerging biomedical field, requires approval for human trials and encounters multiple challenges. You are the head of a team of scientists who developed a new Tissue Engineering system, which appears to be a promising means of regenerating heart tissue. Trials of the system have already been conducted on animals and yielded good results. Millions of people suffering from critical heart diseases would benefit immensely if this medication is immediately made available to them. However, you need to conduct human clinical trials before it could be commercialised. It is also known that the stringent regulatory environment in the country will mean that human trials and final approval will take many years before it is made commercially available. On the other hand, regulation of clinical trials in many poor countries is weak and quick approval is possible. Many of your competitors also resort to human trials in these countries, often bribing the officials for getting quick approvals.

Given this situation, answer the following questions:

- Identify the ethical issues which arise during clinical trials.
- Given the above situation, would you prefer to shift human trials to a third country where regulations are lax? Give reasons in support of your choice.
- Suggest a framework of standard procedure to minimise ethical conflicts and speed-up the approval process of new medicines.

25

मानव पर नैदानिक परीक्षण (clinical trials) के विनियम और प्रक्रियाएं राष्ट्र दर राष्ट्र भिन्न हैं। एक उभरते बायोमेडिकल क्षेत्र के रूप में स्टेम सेल शोध के लिए मानवीय परीक्षणों हेतु स्वीकृति की आवश्यकता होती है और इसे चुनौतियों का सामना करना पड़ता है। आप वैज्ञानिकों के एक दल के नेतृत्वकर्ता हैं जिन्होंने एक नई टिशू इंजीनियरिंग सिस्टम विकसित किया है जो हृदय के उत्तकों (टिशूज) को पुनः पैदा करने हेतु आशावान साधन नजर आता है। इस सिस्टम का पहले ही जानवरों पर परीक्षण किया जा चुका है और उसके अच्छे परिणाम मिले हैं। गंभीर हृदय रोगों में जूझते लाखों-लाख लोगों को इसे अत्यधिक लाभ होगा यदि यह इलाज उनके लिए शीघ्र उपलब्ध करा दिया जाता है। हालांकि इसके वाणिज्यीकरण से पूर्व मानव पर नैदानिक परीक्षण करने की आवश्यकता होती है। यह भी ज्ञात है कि इसके वाणिज्यिक रूप से (बाजार में) उपलब्ध होने से पूर्व देश में विनियमन संबंधी कठोर वातावरण के कारण मानवीय परीक्षण और अंतिम स्वीकृति में वर्षों लग जाएंगे। वहीं दूसरी ओर बहुत से गरीब राष्ट्रों में नैदानिक परीक्षण सम्बन्धी विनियमन ढीले हैं और शीघ्र स्वीकृति संभव है। आपके बहुत-से प्रतिद्वंदी भी नैदानिक परीक्षण हेतु प्रायः ऐसे राष्ट्रों का रुख करते हैं जहां वे अधिकारियों को रिश्वत दे कर शीघ्र स्वीकृति प्राप्त कर लेते हैं।

दी गई परिस्थिति के अनुसार निम्नलिखित प्रश्नों के उत्तर दीजिए:

- नैदानिक परीक्षण के दौरान उभरने वाले नैतिक मुद्दों की पहचान कीजिए।
- दी गई उपर्युक्त परिस्थिति में, क्या आप मानवीय परीक्षणों को किसी तीसरे देश में स्थानांतरित करना पसंद करेंगे जहां विनियमन ढीले हैं? अपने चयन हेतु कारण दीजिए।
- नैतिक संघर्ष को कम करने एवं नई दवाइयों हेतु स्वीकृति की प्रक्रिया को तीव्र करने के लिए मानक प्रक्रिया का एक प्रारूप सुझाइए।

(a) Ethical issues which arise during clinical trials:

(1) Subjecting few people to trials for generating ^{serving} larger interest of public.

This may be morally justified as the potential discovery has potential of bringing largest good to largest number. But justice of few people are being put at stake in the process. Equality is denied to them.

(2) Disproportionate effect on poor.

The people who readily turn up for clinical trials are generally from poor and vulnerable section.

This may not be morally right

given that for benefit of society
there is disproportionate burden on
the poor.

(3) The end cannot always justify
the means

Though the end is morally right,
means adopted may not be. There
are chances that vulnerable
individuals are forced into clinical
trials without they being properly
aware of the consequences. An
informed choice may be denied
through deception.

(4) The death of a man undergoing
trial - at this situation who
would take moral responsibility
for the harm done.

(b) In this situation I would
decide not to shift the human
trials to a third country.

Merely Being a poor country,
The third country have lax
regulations as being poor they cannot
afford to lose any potential
resources. They may lack capacity
to have sufficient informed decisions
on regulations. I cannot make
use of such a vulnerability of
the ~~third countrymen~~ of that country

Also having a strict regulatory
framework in my country would
provide an efficient environment

to ensure that the discovery has no potential effect on the persons on trial also. Given the merits in trials in my country and demerits of shifting trials, I would chose to go with decision that would not prick my team's, or my conscience.

However I would persuade the government to make the approval procedure more efficient in order to avoid any delays in completion of trials of ~~drug~~^a system that is need of the hour.

(e) A framework of standard operating procedure to meet dual

need of ① speedy approval
② avoiding ethical conflict
may be suggested as:

- ① Creation of a timeline based standard operating procedure. [SOP]
- ② SOP should include ethical standards like

- ① whether person undergoing trial is well informed
- ② whether he has ~~pro~~ been provided insurance facility in case of any harm.
- ③ Case of trials is not forced or coerced.

- ③ There may be an ethical committee without that would have to submit report to authority in a time bound manner so that approval is expedited. based on potential benefits.