

Request For Proposals #201210412

Scoring Summary and Recommendations

RFP Timeline Milestones

RFP Published: November 20, 2012 8:53:47 AM EST
 Bidders' Conference: November 29, 2012 10:00 AM EST
 RFP Proposals Deadline: January 14, 2013 2:00 PM EST
 Bidders' Oral Presentations: January 23-24, 2013 all day

Evaluation Team	Affiliation	State
Jeff Mao	Learning Through Technology Team, Department of Education	ME
Mark Lutte	Division of Purchases, Bureau of General Services	ME
Stephanie Shipton	Office of Strategic Reform, Department of Education	HI
David Wu	Office of Information Technology, Department of Education	HI
Peter Drescher	Integrated Support for Learning Division, Agency of Education	VT
John McIntyre	Office of Purchasing and Contracting, BGS Financial Operations Division	VT

Procurement Consultant

Paul Stembler, National Association of State Procurement Officials

Process Overview

A scoring rubric for proposals was defined in the RFP document in **Part V Proposal Evaluation and Selection**. Evaluation Team members were provided copies of the RFP proposals to read independently. The Team met numerous times via conference call and in-person to discuss the proposals and determine consensus scores for the Specifications of Work, Organization Qualifications and Experience, and Economic Impact. Price proposals were determined using standard practices (low bid earns full points, other bids are divided into the low bid, and multiplied by the total points possible). Seven Bidders representing 10 different proposals were invited to provide Oral Presentations.

Recommendation

Based on the consensus scores of the Evaluation Team combined with the calculated Cost Proposal scores, as per the RFP, the Evaluation Team recommends that multiple awards be made to the following Bidders and proposals:

1. Apple, Inc., Primary Proposal — (Student iPad, Teacher MacBook Air & iPad Mini)
2. Apple, Inc., Alternate Proposal — (Student & Teacher MacBook Air)
3. CTL, Primary Proposal — (Student & Teacher CTL 2go Convertible Classmate NL4)
4. Hewlett-Packard Company, Primary Proposal — (HP ProBook 4440)
5. Hewlett-Packard Company, Alternate Proposal — (HP ElitePad Tablet)

Jeff Mao — RFP Coordinator

Tier 1 Overall Scoring

Bidder Name	Organization Qualifications and Experience	Specifications of Work to be Performed	Cost Proposal	Economic Impact	Total Points
Apple (Primary)	15	50	25.0	3	93.0
Apple (Alternate)	15	52	20.8	3	90.8
CTL	10	45	19.4	5	79.4
HP (Primary)	10	42	23.3	4	79.3
HP (Alternate)	9	44	19.3	4	76.3
CDW-G (Primary)	11	36	16.3	5	68.3
Dell	11	42	10.3	3	66.3
Logical Choice	5	40	6.1	4	55.1
Amplify	7	23	19.3	4	53.3
CDW-G (Alternate)	10	21	17.1	5	53.1
Hub Tech Services	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA
Imagine Learning	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA
Knovation	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA
Net Texts (Primary)	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA
Net Texts (Alternate)	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA
Promevo	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA

Points Possible

(15) Organization Qualifications and Experience

(55) Specifications of Work to be Performed

(25) Cost Proposal

(5) Economic Impact

(100) TOTAL

Tier 2 Overall Scoring

Bidder Name	Organization Qualifications and Experience	Specifications of Work to be Performed	Cost Proposal	Economic Impact	Total Points
Apple (Primary)	15	50	19.3	3	87.3
Apple (Alternate)	15	52	15.3	3	85.3
CTL	10	45	23.1	5	83.1
HP (Primary)	10	42	25.0	4	81.0
HP (Alternate)	9	44	21.0	4	78.0
CDW-G (Primary)	11	36	18.8	5	70.8
Dell	11	42	12.2	3	68.2
Logical Choice	5	40	7.3	4	56.3
CDW-G (Alternate)	10	21	20.0	5	56.0
Amplify	7	23	NA	4	NA
Hub Tech Services	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA
Imagine Learning	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA
Knovation	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA
Net Texts (Primary)	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA
Net Texts (Alternate)	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA
Promevo	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA

Points Possible

(15) Organization Qualifications and Experience

(55) Specifications of Work to be Performed

(25) Cost Proposal

(5) Economic Impact

(100) TOTAL

Tier 3 Overall Scoring

Bidder Name	Organization Qualifications and Experience	Specifications of Work to be Performed	Cost Proposal	Economic Impact	Total Points
CTL	10	45	24.6	5	84.6
HP (Primary)	10	42	25.0	4	81.0
HP (Alternate)	9	44	21.3	4	78.3
CDW-G (Primary)	11	36	17.1	5	69.1
Dell	11	42	13.1	3	69.1
Logical Choice	5	40	7.7	4	56.7
CDW-G (Alternate)	10	21	19.5	5	55.5
Amplify	7	23	NA	4	NA
Apple (Primary)	15	50	NA	3	NA
Apple (Alternate)	15	52	NA	3	NA
Hub Tech Services	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA
Imagine Learning	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA
Knovation	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA
Net Texts (Primary)	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA
Net Texts (Alternate)	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA
Promevo	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA

Points Possible

(15) Organization Qualifications and Experience

(55) Specifications of Work to be Performed

(25) Cost Proposal

(5) Economic Impact

(100) TOTAL

Cost Proposal Scoring Calculations — Tier 1

Bidder Name	Tier	Student/Teacher Learning Technology Solution Cost per seat, per year	School Wireless Network Cost per seat, per year	Total 4-Year Cost per seat*	Total Point Score
Apple (Primary)	1	\$217.00	\$49.00	\$1,064.00	25.0
HP (Primary)	1	\$254.86	\$30.91	\$1,143.08	23.3
Apple (Alternate)	1	\$273.00	\$46.00	\$1,276.00	20.8
CTL	1	\$294.00	\$49.00	\$1,372.00	19.4
Amplify	1	\$269.00	\$75.00	\$1,376.00	19.3
HP (Alternate)	1	\$314.28	\$30.91	\$1,380.76	19.3
CDW-G (Alternate)	1	\$305.29	\$84.26	\$1,558.20	17.1
CDW-G (Primary)	1	\$324.96	\$84.26	\$1,636.88	16.3
Dell	1	\$404.35 + \$100 one-time	\$218.09	\$2,589.76	10.3
Logical Choice	1	\$952.00	\$132.00	\$4,336.00	6.1
Hub Tech Services	1	NA**	NA	NA	NA
Imagine Learning	1	\$120.00	NA	NA	NA
Knovation	1	\$2.00	NA	NA	NA
Net Texts (Primary)	1	\$10.00	NA	NA	NA
Net Texts (Alternate)	1	\$80.00	NA	NA	NA
Promevo	1	\$273.28	NA	NA	NA

*The RFP required that Cost Proposals be expressed as a per seat, per year price for four years. Additionally, Bidders' were asked to report pricing for Tier 1, 2, and 3 states as well as a per seat, per year cost for wireless networks. Bidders' cost proposals (Solution + Network) were multiplied by 4 to calculate the equivalent full 4 year cost. One Bidder included an additional fee, their total was multiplied by 4 and then the one-time fee per seat was added to calculate the equivalent full 4 year cost.

**Cost Proposals represented as "NA" were either not submitted by the Bidder or did not follow the RFP required form. Total 4-Year Cost per seat or Total Point Scores represented as "NA" could not be calculated due to missing or malformed Cost Proposal figures.

Cost Proposal Scoring Calculations — Tier 2

Bidder Name	Tier	Student/Teacher Learning Technology Solution Cost per seat, per year	School Wireless Network Cost per seat, per year	Total 4-Year Cost per seat*	Total Point Score
HP (Primary)	2	\$285.73	\$30.91	\$1,266.56	25.0
CTL	2	\$294.00	\$49.00	\$1,372.00	23.1
HP (Alternate)	2	\$345.15	\$30.91	\$1,504.24	21.0
CDW-G (Alternate)	2	\$311.94	\$84.26	\$1,584.80	20.0
Apple (Primary)	2	\$361.00	\$49.00	\$1,640.00	19.3
CDW-G (Primary)	2	\$335.99	\$84.26	\$1,681.00	18.8
Apple (Alternate)	2	\$471.00	\$46.00	\$2,068.00	15.3
Dell	2	\$404.35 + \$100 one-time	\$218.09	\$2,589.76	12.2
Logical Choice	2	\$957.00	\$132.00	\$4,356.00	7.3
Amplify	2	NA**	NA	NA	NA
Hub Tech Services	2	NA	NA	NA	NA
Imagine Learning	2	\$135.00	NA	NA	NA
Knovation	2	\$2.00	NA	NA	NA
Net Texts (Primary)	2	\$10.00	NA	NA	NA
Net Texts (Alternate)	2	\$80.00	NA	NA	NA
Promevo	2	\$273.28	NA	NA	NA

* The RFP required that Cost Proposals be expressed as a per seat, per year price for four years. Additionally, Bidders' were asked to report pricing for Tier 1, 2, and 3 states as well as a per seat, per year cost for wireless networks. Bidders' cost proposals (Solution + Network) were multiplied by 4 to calculate the equivalent full 4 year cost. One Bidder included an additional fee, their total was multiplied by 4 and then the one-time fee per seat was added to calculate the equivalent full 4 year cost.

**Cost Proposals represented as "NA" were either not submitted by the Bidder or did not follow the RFP required form. Total 4-Year Cost per seat or Total Point Scores represented as "NA" could not be calculated due to missing or malformed Cost Proposal figures.

Cost Proposal Scoring Calculations — Tier 3

Bidder Name	Tier	Student/Teacher Learning Technology Solution Cost per seat, per year	School Wireless Network Cost per seat, per year	Total 4-Year Cost per seat*	Total Point Score
HP (Primary)	3	\$307.10	\$30.91	\$1,352.04	25.0
CTL	3	\$294.00	\$49.00	\$1,372.00	24.6
HP (Alternate)	3	\$366.51	\$30.91	\$1,589.68	21.3
CDW-G (Alternate)	3	\$349.76	\$84.26	\$1,736.08	19.5
CDW-G (Primary)	3	\$408.95	\$84.26	\$1,972.84	17.1
Dell	3	\$404.35 + \$100 one-time	\$218.09	\$2,589.76	13.1
Logical Choice	3	\$962.00	\$132.00	\$4,376.00	7.7
Amplify	3	NA**	NA	NA	NA
Apple (Primary)	3	NA	NA	NA	NA
Apple (Alternate)	3	NA	NA	NA	NA
Hub Tech Services	3	NA	NA	NA	NA
Imagine Learning	3	NA	NA	NA	NA
Knovation	3	NA	NA	NA	NA
Net Texts (Primary)	3	NA	NA	NA	NA
Net Texts (Alternate)	3	NA	NA	NA	NA
Promevo	3	NA	NA	NA	NA

* The RFP required that Cost Proposals be expressed as a per seat, per year price for four years. Additionally, Bidders' were asked to report pricing for Tier 1, 2, and 3 states as well as a per seat, per year cost for wireless networks. Bidders' cost proposals (Solution + Network) were multiplied by 4 to calculate the equivalent full 4 year cost. One Bidder included an additional fee, their total was multiplied by 4 and then the one-time fee per seat was added to calculate the equivalent full 4 year cost.

**Cost Proposals represented as "NA" were either not submitted by the Bidder or did not follow the RFP required form. Total 4-Year Cost per seat or Total Point Scores represented as "NA" could not be calculated due to missing or malformed Cost Proposal figures.