

RECOMMENDATION REPORT

T/R NUMBER: M2002 SOLICITATION NUMBER: 14-X-23312 CONTRACT NUMBER: TBD

REPORT DATE: 02/24/14	PROPOSAL WEB POST DATE: 10/31/13	N/A <input type="checkbox"/>	PROPOSAL OPENING DATE: 01/07/14	N/A <input type="checkbox"/>	# OF PROPOSALS RECEIVED: 2	N/A <input type="checkbox"/>	ESTIMATED CONTRACT DOLLAR VALUE: \$2,550,000.00	N/A <input type="checkbox"/>	Current Expiration End Date:	N/A <input checked="" type="checkbox"/>
--------------------------	-------------------------------------	---------------------------------	------------------------------------	---------------------------------	-------------------------------	---------------------------------	--	---------------------------------	------------------------------	--

TO: Jignasa Desai-McCleary, Director
FROM: Robert Beauregard, Assistant Director

PROJECT NAME: Child Safety Seats - WSCA-NASPO Cooperative Contract

Recommendation Type(s):

<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> New Award	<input type="checkbox"/> Sole Bidder	<input type="checkbox"/> Award Amendment	<input type="checkbox"/> Supplemental Award
<input type="checkbox"/> RFP Cancellation	<input type="checkbox"/> Contract Amendment	<input type="checkbox"/> Contract Assignment	
<input type="checkbox"/> Contract Extension	<input type="checkbox"/> 3.2/5.3 Contract Extension	<input type="checkbox"/> Transitional Contract Extension	
<input type="checkbox"/> Other:			

Mandatory Forms:

	Yes	No	N/A
Bid Security	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>
Business Registration Certificate	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Ownership Disclosure	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Disclosure of Investigations and Actions Involving Bidder	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>

	Yes	No	N/A
Small Business Registration	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>
Notice of Intent to Subcontract	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>
Subcontractor Utilization Plan	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>
Disclosure of Investment Activities in Iran	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>

RECOMMENDATION:

It is recommended that award of the new term contract for child safety seats solicited on behalf of WSCA-NASPO Cooperative Purchasing Organization be made to the following manufacturer and distributor of child safety seats:

Evenflo Company, Inc., of Cullman, Alabama
Vehicle Maintenance Program of Boca Raton, Florida

See the attached child safety seat evaluation results for a complete list of awards and no awards.

This will be a two (2) year contract term which may be extended for all or part of two (2), one year periods. The anticipated commencement date for this contract is April 1, 2014 with an expiration date of March 31, 2016.

This RFP was approved by Deputy Treasurer Robert Romano on September 19, 2012.

JUSTIFICATION:

Contracts awarded as a result of this RFP will establish master agreements with qualified manufacturers and distributors to provide safe reliable child safety seats in compliance with the National Highway Traffic Safety Administration (NHTSA) and Federal Motor Vehicle Safety Standards (FMVSS-213). Award of these contracts will provide participating States with the opportunity to establish their own individual contract(s) with either Vehicle Maintenance Program Inc., or Evenflo Company Inc. Multiple contract awards will provide the States that are not permitted to have multiple awards the opportunity to choose the vendor that best meets their needs such as pricing, brand, selection, etc.

Child safety seats procured as a result of these contract awards shall be used for the safe transportation of children currently in the custody of the Department of Children and Family Services and/or the Department of Human Services as well as distributed to foster families and low income families. Contracts awarded as a result of this solicitation shall also be available for use by Cooperative Purchasing Partners.

TO BE INCLUDED WITH REPORT: DOCUMENTATION IN ACCORDANCE WITH APPLICABLE OPERATING PROCEDURES

APPROVALS:

Procurement Lead / Date
3-14-14

Procurement Supervisor / Date
3/14/14

Assistant Director / Date

Deputy Director / Date

Acting Director / Date

The following schedule of events took place in this solicitation:

- October 31, 2013 – Request for Proposal advertised;
- November 20, 2013 – Optional RFP release webinar;
- December 3, 2013 – EQ&A submission;
- January 7, 2014 – Proposals due; and
- January 27th, 28th & 29, 2014 – Mandatory Child Safety Seat Evaluation.

The following two (2) proposals were received on January 7, 2014 and deemed to be responsive by the WSCA-NASPO Cooperative Purchasing Organization and the Child Safety Seat Sourcing Team:

- Vehicle Maintenance Program Inc.; and
- Evenflo Company Inc.

Mandatory Child Safety Seat Evaluations were scheduled as follows:

January 27, 2014 – Vehicle Maintenance Program Inc. presented a sample of each child safety seat offered within its proposal. Each seat was inspected for safety and specification compliance. The following child safety seats failed to meet the specifications as listed in Attachment 1 of the RFP:

- Convertible Seat with harness rethreading required – Cosco model number CC078BJB failed to meet the height requirement of 54 inches, substituted with Evenflo model number 3712198;
- Convertible seat with NO harness rethreading required – Cosco model number CC068BJB, failed to meet the no harness rethreading requirements, substituted with Safety 1st, model number CC110AVP all specifications; and
- Infant Seat – Evenflo model number 3151195 failed to meet the specification of head support (i.e. no pillow), substituted with Safety 1st, model number ICO68FSM.

Due to the inability to actually determine if a child safety seat meets the specification requirements until the seat is physically inspected and evaluated, the lead State in conjunction with the WSCA-NASPO Cooperative Purchasing Organization approved and permitted Vehicle Maintenance Program, Inc., to substitute the above child safety seats with models meeting the specifications. The substitutions were approved with the stipulation they would be substituted at the original proposal pricing submitted.

Verbal discussions with Vehicle Maintenance Program Inc. which were also confirmed in writing indicated it would extend the manufacturer warranty on each child seat from one (1) year to five (5) to six (6) years. All child seats substituted were substituted at the original proposal pricing offered.

January 28, 2014 – Evenflo Company Inc. presented a sample of each child safety seat offered within its proposal. Each seat was inspected for safety and specification compliance. The following child safety seats failed to meet the specifications as listed in Attachment 1 of the RFP. Evenflo Company Inc. was offered the opportunity to substitute the child seats failing to comply with the specifications and was informed that any child seat substituted must be substituted at the proposal pricing originally submitted. Evenflo Company Inc., stated they would not substitute the seats at the original proposal pricing; therefore, the following child seats will not be awarded to Evenflo Company Inc.:

- Combination Seat – Evenflo model number 3062198 – failed to meet the weight requirements with the use of a harness;
- Combination Seat - Evenflo model number 3702098 – failed to meet the height requirement of 54”;
- Convertible with harness rethreading required – Evenflo model number 3812198 failed to meet the height requirement of 54”;
- Convertible with NO harness rethreading required – Evenflo model number 3821167 failed to meet the height requirement of 52”;
- Infant Seat – Evenflo model number 3152198 insufficient head support (i.e. no pillow); and
- Infant Seat – Evenflo model number 3022198 failed to have a foot adjuster and difficult to remove seat from base.

Verbal discussions with Evenflo Company which were also confirmed in writing indicated it would not substitute any of the child seats failing to meet the specifications and the manufacturer's warranty of one (1) year would not be extended.

BAFO Submission:

Vehicle Maintenance Program Inc. submitted a BAFO price sheet which indicated the actual list price of each child safety seat proposed and the percentage discount off of the list price. In summary the BAFO price sheet submitted by Vehicle Maintenance Program Inc., indicated the discount had already been applied with the original proposal pricing submission.

Evenflo Company Inc. responded to the BAFO request with a written statement and stated the original proposal pricing would remain unchanged.

RECOMMENDATION REPORT

Evenflo Company Inc. was once again contacted for additional negotiations once it was discovered that the price of an identical child safety seat was three percent (3%) lower on a contract currently active for the State of Ohio. Evenflo Company Inc., stated that the pricing would need to remain as originally proposed for the following reasons:

- The Evenflo factory is located in Ohio, greatly reducing shipping cost;
- The Ohio contract does not require inside delivery, whereas contracts awarded as a result of this WSCA-NASPO Cooperative agreement, require inside delivery as defined within the RFP; and
- The Ohio contract requires a five-hundred dollar (\$500.00) minimum order which further reduces the shipping cost.

Pricing Comparison:

The proposal pricing submitted by Vehicle Maintenance Program Inc. and Evenflo Company Inc. has been compared to the estimated quantity amounts (detailed information attached) intended to be procured by the participating states. This comparison indicates that pricing proposed by Vehicle Maintenance Program (an authorized distributor of child safety seats is comparable to the proposal pricing submitted by Evenflo Company Inc. (a child safety seat manufacturer).

The proposal pricing submitted by Vehicle Maintenance Program Inc., is a flat rate regardless of the delivery region. Vehicle Maintenance Program Inc. is also offering all replacement parts free of charge. The proposal pricing submitted by Evenflo Company Inc., includes a delivery charge based on the delivery region and a percentage discount off list price for all replacement parts; therefore, for the purpose of this pricing comparison the corresponding rate for the delivery region has been used.

A pricing analysis conducted by the DPP Pricing Analyst, of existing agreements in other states including the states having already signed an "Intent to Participate" in this WSCA-NASPO RFP, indicates an overall reduced cost.

Therefore, based on the above factors and a pricing analysis of agreements currently in place in other states for these items, it is been concluded that this RFP resulted in fair and competitive pricing for child safety seats.

In conclusion it is considered to be advantageous to the State of New Jersey and the WSCA-NASPO Cooperative Purchasing Organization to award contracts to both Evenflo Company Inc., and Vehicle Maintenance Program Inc.

Financial Analysis:

A review of the financial statements submitted by both Vehicle Maintenance Program Inc. and Evenflo Company indicates that both companies are financially capable to carry out the activities of this cooperative contract.

State of New Jersey Debarment List:

Neither Vehicle Maintenance Program Inc., nor Evenflo Company Inc., is listed on the State of New Jersey Debarment list.

Additional Comments:

Vehicle Maintenance Program Inc. is a woman owned and operated small business in Florida and is a member of the National Women's Business Enterprise.

Evenflo Company Inc. is a manufacturer of child safety seats with ninety (90) years of experience.

A review of the contract compliance audit files indicates there are no outstanding formal complaints on file against Vehicle Maintenance Program Inc., or Evenflo Company.

Both Vehicle Maintenance Program Inc., and Evenflo Company Inc., are in compliance with Ownership Disclosure and are registered with the Division of Revenue Business Registration.

Attached to this Recommendation Report are the following:

- Treasurer's office approval to advertise;
- Signed specification submittal;
- Approval for multiple award;
- Excel Bid Tabulation;
- Child Safety Seat Evaluation Results;
- Pricing Comparison;
- MACSE VINF Print Screens;
- Vehicle Maintenance Program Inc., certifications;
- Financial Review Analysis;
- Pricing Analyst report; and
- RFP copy.

PREPARED BY:


Lina Groninger
Procurement Specialist

DATE: 3-14-14